



345 Queen Street, Suite 802
Honolulu, Hawaii 96813
Phone: (808) 521-9418
Fax: (808) 521-9468
E-Mail: jwhalen@planpacific.com

PLANPACIFIC **M E M O R A N D U M**

DATE: **May 17, 2007**

TO: **Puna Community Development Plan Steering Committee**

FROM: **John P. Whalen, FAICP**

SUBJECT: **Compiled comments and recommendations on Working Group reports**

Attached is a table that compiles the recommendations of the Working Groups (WGs) and provides my comments and suggestions on each of the WG reports, except for those submitted by the Transportation WG. I am deferring comments on the latter until the transportation sub-consultant, Wayne Yoshioka, completes his community meetings and offers his recommendations.

To preface to the particular comments and suggestions in the attached, the following explains the approach that I have taken:

1. I tried to keep, as much as possible, to the intent of the WGs' recommendations, even if the language in the "suggested wording" is not taken verbatim from WG report. Often, the re-wording was to achieve a consistency in style or organization.
2. Some of the statements in WG reports express goals or provide background or supporting rationale for a recommendation rather than state a policy or action that can be implemented, so there is no "suggested wording" to correspond to those statements.
3. There were many overlapping recommendations among the WGs, although fortunately no glaring inconsistencies or conflicts. I made cross-references to other WGs where overlaps occur and responded to the recommendation of the WG that seemed to have "lead" responsibility for that particular subject.
4. Where there were gaps in WG recommendations - e.g., no report from Economic Opportunities, a partial report from Public Services & Infrastructure, incomplete information about agency plans - I added suggestions drawn from other WG reports, or WG coordinators or from agency interviews or documents. The absence of a recommendation regarding water system development is a very significant omission. The General Plan does not provide strong policy guidance on the extent to which public water systems should be expanded in Puna. Based on comments during the Small Group process, the break-out group discussions

at the two CDP workshops, and statements and plans submitted by community associations, it appears that there is support for water system development to replace catchment systems in the more rapidly developing subdivisions in Puna Waena (e.g., Hawaiian Paradise Park, Orchidland), and to expand access to the existing Mountain View-Ola'a system to support agricultural uses. There appears to be little or no support for public water systems in the "Central Corridor" subdivisions extending from Volcano through Hawaiian Acres. I have offered suggested wording to reflect this understanding.

5. I added some new proposed implementing actions where it seemed they would respond to goals and objectives set forth by the WGs. For example, I suggested that the County retain subdivision lots that are in foreclosure for non-payment of real property taxes rather than auctioning them to the highest bidder. In an analysis of auction results since 1990 we found that nearly half of these properties were sold to buyers of multiple properties, presumably for latter re-sale, either with or without a dwelling built on speculation. This practice exacerbates the rise in land values and development activity. The County could use these lots as relocation sites for properties that need to be acquired for new rights-of-way or public uses, or to facilitate a land pooling project initiated by a community association for the creation of a village center.
6. Some of the WG recommendations were highly specific, sometimes to the degree appropriate for a regulatory code. In those instances, I provide suggested language that omits detailed provisions so that they can be considered more carefully and deliberately when preparing follow-up code amendments. Codes rely heavily on formal definitions of terms and detailed standards and procedures that need to be crafted with great care. Otherwise they can have unintended consequences. The CDP is a good vehicle for stating the purpose and intent and setting some parameters for the standards and definitions for the code amendments, but it should stop short of highly prescriptive language.
7. When taken in total, the WG recommendations have significant fiscal implications for the County. Some proposed to delegate to the County responsibilities that the Federal or State governments are legally mandated to assume. While there were many proposals to increase County expenditures, there were also several that would reduce the County's main source of revenue - real property taxes. Of the three levels of government, the County has the narrowest tax base, by far the smallest amount of tax revenue, and many significant demands to provide basic life safety services. On the other hand, it may make fiscal sense for the County to complement the roles of the Federal and State governments where this can leverage eligibility for Federal and State funding sources that are not presently being tapped. Several responses to the WGs suggest how to do that.

8. Many of the WG recommendations (shown in light shading) have islandwide applicability rather than being specific to Puna. From that point of view, they would be more appropriate as General Plan amendments rather than CDP policies or implementing actions. Several CDPs are proceeding in close succession, so there is a possibility that there will be competing or even incompatible recommendations on the same islandwide issues emerging from the various CDPs. In the final analysis, the Planning Department and County Council will have to resolve discrepancies and decide what belongs in the CDP. In reviewing the WG recommendations, I found that while many had islandwide implications, they legitimately addressed issues that were important to Puna. Therefore, I offered suggested wording for these recommendations and will leave it for others in the County to decide whether it should be part of the CDP or a possible General Plan amendment.
9. Some of the WG recommendations proposed changes to the structure of the County government - e.g., creating new or altering the functions or composition of existing agencies, elected or appointed bodies - most of which would require an amendment to the County Charter by vote of the electorate. Among these recommendations, the one that seemed the most promising - and the most directly related to the CDP - was the creation of a Puna Communities Council (or variants on that name.) It would be useful for the Steering Committee to consider some questions about this new body, e.g.:
 - Would its members be appointed or elected?
 - Would it be strictly advisory or have some decision-making responsibilities?
 - What would be its responsibilities relative to other County agencies and bodies?
 - Would it have County staff support? If so, what kind?

Comments/Suggestions re Agriculture Working Group Recommendations

AGRICULTURE WORKING GROUP RECOMMENDATION:	COMMENTS/SUGGESTION:
<p>Prioritize land-use, fiscal, and economics-development policy outcomes compatible with expansion of local agriculture to supply local markets and sustainable stewardship of essential agricultural land.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Economic opportunity for expanding agriculture in Puna to the benefit and empowerment of families and communities in Puna. ▪ Sustained ability for Puna residents to steward and rely on agricultural lands in the District for the purpose of supplying local markets and to the overall benefit of the wider Puna community. ▪ Agricultural lands, now idle and often overrun with invasive species, brought into production with wholly-sustainable, market-driven, economically-competitive agriculture. ▪ Development and continuous enhancement of agricultural production, marketing, and business management skills through formal and informal education. ▪ Public and/or private investment in ‘agricultural parks’ or equivalent. Contiguous parcel(s) of essential agricultural land of quantity and quality suitable for qualified farmers to reside and operate in shared proximity, to generate co-location benefits: enhanced security, availability of electricity and water, shared use of specialized machinery, swapping work, etc. ▪ Public and/or private investment in processing, transportation, and distribution infrastructure to supply local markets with local produce. ▪ Partnerships with others – notably University of Hawaii-Hilo, Hawaii Community college, state and Federal agencies, non-profit organizations, and industry groups. 	<p>The top left box contains background information and policy statements rather than recommended implementation measures. These statements can be incorporated into the CDP as introductory background material or in goals statements.</p> <p>Property tax policies have island-wide implications for the County’s principal revenue source. It should be noted that the County already has a “differential assessment” law that assesses agricultural land at its value for agriculture instead of its full fair market value. If this recommendation for further tax relief is included in the CDP rather than as a possible General Plan amendment, below is suggested re-wording. A tree cover incentive is included in the Natural Resources section:</p> <p>Suggested wording: <i>Implement tax and other financial incentives to support active agricultural use of land, including:</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • <i>Alternative valuation methods for lands designated and zoned for agricultural use , such as assessments based on actual use and zoning restrictions on lot area rather than comparable sales;</i> • <i>Discounted tax rate only on agricultural land that is dedicated for agricultural use for a minimum of 20 years;</i> • <i>Substantial penalties for premature withdrawal and/or subdivision of land dedicated for agricultural use, with limited exceptions for family hardship;</i> • <i>Lower tax rates or exemptions for new or improved facilities directly related to distribution, processing and/or storage of local agricultural to supply the Hawaii market;</i> • <i>Lower motor vehicle registration fee for ‘Farm Vehicles’.</i>
<p>Implement valuation reform and tax relief for agriculture.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Review ‘comparable sale’ valuation, as currently used in Hawaii County, regarding its inflationary impact on market prices for agricultural land. ▪ Investigate alternative valuation methods, for example, based on total land area, land class, and/or zoning size designation. ▪ Discount taxation on agricultural land when, and only when, associated with long-term (20 year minimum) dedication to agricultural use. ▪ Apply extreme tax penalties for premature withdrawal and subdivision of land that has been dedicated to long-term agricultural use; with the only exception being cases of family hardship. ▪ Discount taxation of facilities complementary to local agriculture supplying local markets. For example, a ‘tax holiday’ for a facility – new and purpose-built or newly upgraded specifically – for distribution, processing, and/or storing local produce that will supply local markets. ▪ Discount taxation of land with tree cover of noninvasive species; with this consideration especially directed to native forests, tree farms, and forest plantations. ▪ Lower the motor vehicle registration fee for ‘Farm Vehicles’. 	
<p>Establish and vigorously implement an essential agricultural land policy.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Identify individual and contiguous parcels for designation as essential agricultural lands. ▪ Set and tightly adhere to standards and criteria that restrain subdivision of essential agricultural land and/or changes to zoning of essential agricultural land away from agricultural uses. 	<p>These recommendations can be implemented more simply, quickly and comprehensively by adopting a new district-wide zoning map for agricultural lands that would effectively limit further subdivision. Rezoning is justifiable from a growth management standpoint, not just for the preservation of large tracts of agricultural land. District-wide rezoning</p>

Comments/Suggestions re Agriculture Working Group Recommendations

AGRICULTURE WORKING GROUP RECOMMENDATION:	COMMENTS/SUGGESTION:
<p>Enact and vigorously implement rezoning and subdivision amendments that shift option in favor of agriculture versus sprawl on parcels of essential agricultural land, especially parcels zoned AG-1a, AG-3a, and AG-5a.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Do not allow further subdivision that will result in more than two separate parcels ▪ Do not allow further subdivision that will result in new parcels of less than three acres ▪ Rezone to larger acreage those parcel(s) otherwise dividable by more than two parcels ▪ Combine and rezone two or more contiguous parcels 	<p>would obviate the need to map “essential agricultural land”, which is likely to be time-consuming and fraught with debate over criteria for classifications, the characteristics of specific land areas, etc.</p> <p>Suggested wording: <i>Adopt a district-wide zoning map for lands designated and zoned for agricultural use that closely reflects actual lot size in order to discourage further subdivision of larger tracts of agricultural land without an appropriate zone change and/or State Land Use District boundary amendment.</i></p>
<p>Develop Farmers’ Markets (as part of an island-wide Hawaii County Farmers’ Market)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Identify and zone, fit sites for three full-service, high volume modern farmers markets in Puna: Mountain View (‘old village’/mauka side), Pahoa (at or near intersection of Highways 130 and 132), and Hawaiian Paradise Park (25th and Kaloli; 20-acre site zoned commercial) ▪ Co-locate markets with mass transit ‘hubs’ where appropriate/possible, to create synergy ▪ Put in place basic infrastructure (water, roads, electricity, communications, etc.) ▪ Leverage private investment in the farmers market sites 	<p>Suggested wording: <i>Develop Farmers’ Markets to promote local agricultural trade and provide residents with access to low-cost food products. Public sector support for the acquisition of suitable sites and development of basic infrastructure should be used to leverage private investment. Potential locations are:</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • <i>Mountain View, in the “old village” section mauka of Highway 11;</i> • <i>Pahoa, at or near the intersection of Highways 130 and 132; and</i> • <i>Hawaiian Paradise Park, on the 20-acre site reserved for commercial use at Kaloli Drive and 25th Street;</i> • <i>Adjacent to a mass transit “hub”.</i>
<p>Establish ‘Puna Agricultural Scholarship’ (Hawaii Community College)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ To pay for tuition, fees, and cost of textbooks and supplies, for one year for a Puna high-school graduate enrolled as a first-year Agricultural student at Hawaii Community College ▪ Approximately \$3,000 per year; from County annual appropriation and/or private contributions. 	<p>County property tax revenues are presently stretched to provide basic public health and safety services and community facilities. While the amount of County contribution that is proposed for agricultural education and research is not large, it is likely that County officials will question the appropriateness of making these expenditures when the State government clearly has the responsibility for funding these activities and has a broader tax base, greater revenue, and access to Federal grants for this purpose. These would be good recommendations to ask Puna’s State legislators to implement, and since the funding amounts could be higher there is no reason to set an arbitrary limit.</p>
<p>Establish ‘Sustainable Agriculture Research and Development Fund’ (University of Hawaii – Hilo)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Seed funding to leverage public and private investment that will enable local agriculture to supply local markets. ▪ Market research and development to identify and satisfy local agricultural market preferences and requirements. ▪ Production research and development to make optimum use of land, infrastructure, and local human resources to enable wholly sustainable local agriculture to supply local markets. ▪ Local promotion of local agricultural products that fulfill local market preferences and requirements. ▪ Portion of property tax collected on all parcels zoned in the ‘Agricultural District’ in Puna; with target of approximately \$50,000 or more per year seed money to attract matching funding from UHH and/or others in the community. 	<p>Suggested wording: <i>Provide public funding, supplemented by private sector contributions, for education and research to promote appropriate agricultural development in Puna by:</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • <i>Establishing a scholarship for a Puna high school graduate to pursue agricultural education at Hawaii Community College; and</i> • <i>Establishing a Sustainable Agriculture Research and Development Fund at the University of Hawaii-Hilo for market and production research and development to promote sustainable agricultural practices, making optimal use of land, infrastructure and local human resources to serve local markets.</i>

Comments/Suggestions re Alternative Energy Working Group Recommendations

ALTERNATIVE ENERGY WORKING GROUP:	COMMENTS/SUGGESTIONS:
The County of Hawaii uses the County of Maui as a model to create a program of low interest loans to install solar water heating systems.	It seems that these were meant to be goal statements. Since they are embedded in subsequent recommendations for implementation measures, comments on these proposals are provided below.
The County of Hawaii moves towards a policy that all new construction use solar water heating systems.	
All County of Hawaii construction and renovation projects in Puna to be built Green using LEED Green Building Rating System or a similar model.	
The County of Hawaii joins other municipalities in the “Million Solar Roofs” campaign.	The suggested wording below reorganizes the recommendations at the left into two implementation proposals: one for funding and the other for education. Since County funding is limited to a loan program, it does not raise tax policy issues. Also, the County can tap State and Federal support for education programs. Suggested wording: <i>Establish a County fund to provide low-interest loans for energy efficient home improvements, including solar heating.</i> <i>Provide County participation in an educational and marketing campaign to promote energy-wise choices, raising awareness of advantages of:</i> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • <i>Solar tax credits, low interest loans and other incentives for solar energy;</i> • <i>Energy-efficient appliances and light bulbs;</i> • <i>Use of mass transit, ride-sharing, car-pooling, and van-pooling;</i> • <i>Recycling and use of recyclable and “green-friendly” products.</i>
Educate the general public of existing alternative funding sources <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Federal and State governments give solar tax credits ▪ Office of Housing and Community Development fund low interest loans for home improvements; solar heating is an acceptable cost 	
The County of Hawaii should create a revolving fund to help fund residents who wish to make energy efficient improvements to their homes	
The County of Hawaii should produce and education marketing campaign that promotes energy-wise choices and funding sources <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Convert to solar heating ▪ Choose energy efficient appliances ▪ Convert all light bulbs to energy efficient bulbs ▪ Recycle and use recycled products ▪ Reduce reliance on fossil fuels ▪ Ride and promote mass transit ▪ Promote ride sharing, car pool, or van pool programs ▪ Choose green friendly products such as paint, wood ▪ Refrain from using Styrofoam ▪ Better use of packaging and making producers responsible for their own waste 	
Create incentives for energy efficient design such as Leadership in Energy and Environmental Design (LEED) or other similar standards. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ All free standing County and State building projects meet the standards for energy efficient designs such as LEED ▪ The new fire, police, and recreation building being planned for Puna should meet LEED standards ▪ Overhead street lights should be solar powered ▪ Any needed signage at the new Pohoiki Recreation Park should be lit by photovoltaic kiosk like the Hilo Bay front kiosk 	Suggested wording: <i>Employ energy-efficient standards such as Leadership in Energy and Environmental Design (LEED) in County and State facilities by:</i> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • <i>Designing all new buildings to LEED standards;</i> • <i>Retrofitting of street lights with photovoltaic cells;</i> • <i>Using photovoltaic cells for exterior signage at parks and other public facilities; and</i> • <i>Applying LEED standards to the review of all new developments that require discretionary land use permits from the County.</i>
Clean renewable energy development <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Solar – develop, promote, and encourage residential, business, and government use of solar generated power. If individuals or business desire to build “off the grid”, the County Planning and Building department should consider all plans that meet design and safety standards. ▪ Bio-fuel – develop bio-fuel alternatives. The County of Hawaii should promote and fund pilot projects in Puna. ▪ OTEC – the land between Hawaiian Shores and Hawaiian Paradise Park is an ideal location for an OTEC plant. The OTEC plant was such a success in Kona in both energy efficiency and employment, Puna should follow suit. 	Suggested wording: <i>Promote clean, renewable energy development by:</i> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • <i>Providing public sector assistance for a pilot project to develop bio-fuels in Puna;</i> • <i>Promoting the use of State land between Hawaiian Beaches & Shores and Hawaiian Paradise Park subdivisions as a site for an Ocean Thermal Energy Conversion (OTEC) plant, similar to the one in Kona.</i>

Comments/Suggestions re Cultural & Historic Preservation Working Group Recommendations

CULTURAL & HISTORIC PRESERVATION WORKING GROUP:	COMMENTS/SUGGESTIONS:
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ The County Council proposes and enacts legislation to establish a Puna Cultural Council as an integral part of County Governance 	<p>These proposals suggest that the County take on responsibilities which presently reside with the State through the Department of Land & Natural Resources and the Hawaii Tourism Authority. Since the County has a much smaller revenue base than the State, it is very unlikely that the County can adequately fund these activities. Instead, the County may be able to complement and supplement to some degree what the State does. For example, the County could strengthen the grading ordinance to protect cultural features [see response to Natural Resources Protection WG.] Also, the County could establish a historic preservation commission, making it eligible for Certified Local Government status and access to Federal historic preservation funds [see http://www.hawaii.gov/dlnr/hpd/hpclg.htm for more information on this program.]</p> <p>Suggested wording: <i>Provide County support for historic and cultural preservation and appreciation by undertaking the following activities:</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • <i>Apply for Certified Local Government status through the State Historic Preservation Division by establishing a County Historic Preservation Commission to provide historic preservation advice to the Planning Department and other agencies and receive preservation grants.</i> • <i>Notify applicants for development permits about guidelines and standards for identifying and protecting cultural and historic artifacts when planning development projects and undertaking construction.</i> • <i>Request State funding for cultural sensitivity training programs for appropriate County employees, realtors, tour guides, and other members of the commercial workforce.</i>
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ The County encourage and/or require participation in cultural sensitivity training programs. This would include opportunities for appropriate County employees, realtors, tour guides, and other members of the commercial workforce and the general population 	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Programs shall be developed in cooperation with the Puna Cultural Council. The County shall establish protocols for identifying and preserving cultural and historic artifacts and incidental finds 	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ The County establish and facilitate frequent cultural learning events, which emphasize Life Skills, Malama Aina, Chants, Genealogies, etc. 	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ The County Planning Department require applicants for building permits, zoning changes, special permits etc. to first visit the Department of Antiquities and Aesthetics for an orientation procedure prior to any development approval 	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ The Department of Antiquities and Aesthetics be required to consult with the Puna Cultural Council in the Development of their orientation program and recommendations 	

Comments/Suggestions re Economic Opportunity Working Group Recommendations

ECONOMIC OPPORTUNITY WORKING GROUP:	COMMENTS/SUGGESTIONS:
<p>NO REPORT SUBMITTED.</p>	<p>The following suggested wording draws from recommendations made in other WG reports, other WG coordinators or from information provided by the County Department of Research and Development: <i>Through a combination of Federal, State and County and private sector resources, programs and initiatives, expand job opportunities in the region by:</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • <i>Developing new and expanding existing Village Centers to provide a wider range of services to Puna’s communities.</i> • <i>Developing business incubator districts in Regional Village Centers where small businesses can, for a start-up period of two to three years, occupy spaces at subsidized rent, share receptionist and other common support services and facilities, and have access to business mentoring and job training programs, and product promotion programs;</i> • <i>Developing a “direct-use” area for enterprises that use geothermal resources, which may include; (1) agricultural applications, such as greenhouses and aquaculture, (2) research and processing applications, such as a University of Hawai’i laboratory, lumber kiln, laundromat, fruit or fish drying, and community kitchen; and (3) industrial applications, such as soil sterilization of potting media and thermoblock.</i> • <i>Promoting use of the incentives offered by Puna’s designation as an AZ Area Enterprise Zone to attract businesses to establish in the area and employ Puna residents;</i> • <i>Developing facilities for renewable energy generation, such as Ocean Thermal Energy Conversion (OTEC), solar and wind power, and capturing steam generation from existing geothermal wells;</i> • <i>Promoting bio-fuel production in Puna;</i> • <i>Facilitating tours that feature Puna’s unique agricultural businesses, such as orchids/anthuriums, papaya, noni, and other tropical fruit, and geothermally heated aquaculture.</i>

Comments/Suggestions re Land Use/Growth Management Working Group Recommendations

LAND USE/GROWTH MANAGEMENT WORKING GROUP:	COMMENTS/SUGGESTIONS:
Focus all intensive development in areas that are already intensively developed (i.e., Kea'au, Pahoia, Volcano). In new intensive developments require integrated communities supporting residences, schools, services and recreation either within or adjacent to the new subdivision	See comments on Land Use/Village Centers Working Group's recommendations re Regional Village Centers.
Create and seed funding mechanisms such as self-sustaining revolving loan funds to encourage upgrading existing large subdivisions to better standards of livability, safety and reduced environmental impact	This recommendation could be expanded to include grants as well as loans. Suggested wording: <i>Investigate the feasibility of providing County grants and/or guaranteed loans for improvements to privately-owned infrastructure facilities in non-conforming subdivisions to improve the safety and reliability of those facilities, whether or not they are improved to County design standards and dedicated to County.</i>
Excluding all current subdivisions and improved properties rezone AG-1a zones in Puna to AG-5a to establish a 5 acre minimum for agricultural zones	See comments on Agricultural Working Group recommendations re "down-zoning" to discourage subdivision of agricultural lands.
Increase county staffing to increase code enforcement activity; increase county initiative for prosecution of the most obvious nonconforming uses, particularly along major roadways	The suggested wording below clarifies that code enforcement is directed toward illegal rather than nonconforming (i.e., legal "grandfathered") uses: <i>Step up code enforcement activity by hiring additional Zoning Inspectors to investigate and issue citations for the most obvious violations, such as dwellings built without permits and unauthorized commercial uses along major roadways.</i>
No cesspools allowed for any new building	Suggested wording:
Require septic system or composting toilets for single family residence	<i>Prohibit cesspools for the issuance of permits for any new buildings, including single family dwellings.</i>
Require aerobic wastewater treatment or composting toilets for new dwellings within 1,000 feet of drilled wells or SMA areas	Suggested wording:
Require aerobic wastewater treatment or composting toilets for new intensive (less than 1 acre) development	<i>Require aerobic wastewater treatment units or composting toilets for the issuance of permits for new dwellings within the Special Management Area, within 1,000 feet of a drilled well, or on lots less than one acre in size.</i>
Prepare an Environmental Assessment to estimate wastewater contamination of the Puna aquifer comparing septic systems versus aerobic systems as a function of expected increased population.	Suggested wording: <i>Urge the Hawaii Department of Health to analyze the cumulative impact of individual wastewater treatment systems on the Puna aquifer and coastal waters based on the projected build-out of subdivision lots.</i>
All new subdivisions and residential building permits for parcels below five acres must meet all county standards for building with no variances for wastewater, drainage, road, water and other requirements	The applicability of this recommendation is unclear, since variances can be granted only on a finding that hardship exists. All regulations must make some provision for variances to withstand a legal challenge if an owner is denied all reasonable use of a property, although the standards for granting variances can and should be strict and hard to meet.
Begin a non-punitive assessment of non-permitted dwellings for property taxes.	Suggested wording: <i>Identify dwellings that have been built without building permits and require their owners to pay property taxes in arrears.</i>
Increase county staffing to increase code inspection and enforcement activity	Repeats an earlier recommendation; see comment seven lines above.
Add safety improvements such as longer merging lanes and stop lights at subdivision intersections to Hwy 130	See comments on Transportation/Existing Roadways Working Group recommendations re intersections and alternative travel modes.
Add alternate types of transportation routes (bicycle, small motor bikes) parallel to existing and new routes	
Alternative access routes between Puna and Hilo are the best long term solution to manage	See comments on Transportation Working Group recommendations re

Comments/Suggestions re Land Use/Growth Management Working Group Recommendations

growth. The Transportation Working Group is considering detailed proposals and we will defer to their recommendations as to how alternative routes should be implemented	alternative corridors.
Develop standards defining commercial agricultural activity for purpose of assigning property tax rates	See comments on Agricultural Working Group and Natural Resources Working Group recommendations re property taxes.
Adjust tax rates to confer advantage on commercial agricultural and conservation land use. Per http://www.hawaiipropertytax.com , current tax rates per \$1000: Improved Residential - \$8.10; Agricultural - \$8.35; Conservation - \$8.55; Homeowner - \$5.55, mitigate against agricultural and conservation land use. By contrast, residential property is the most expensive type for the county to support, requiring roads and schools for instance	These WG recommendations appear to be based on a misunderstanding of how property tax rates and zoning are applied in determining property tax assessments. The Homeowner rate of \$5.55 is the same for all primary residence dwellings regardless of the zoning district in which the dwelling is located. Also, one has to look at the per-acre assessed value of agricultural lands being actively cultivated as compared to agricultural-zoned lands being used for strictly residential purposes or lying vacant.
Move parcels in agricultural zones that do not demonstrate commercial agricultural activity into a residential property tax bracket	
Support taxation at (reduced) conservation zoning rates in exchange for owners agreeing to land banking or conservation easements for significant periods of time such as ten years. Include penalties for early withdrawal. No significant alteration of the conserved property would be allowed other than removal of invasive and other non-native plants and planting of native species	See comments on Natural Resources Working Group recommendations re tax incentives.
Define industrial/commercial zoned areas that are physically associated with current Urban zoning but have minimal impact on residential use	The apparent combined intent of these recommendations is to discourage noxious commercial/industrial uses next to residential areas, and at small, scattered locations. An exception would be industrial uses related to alternative energy production.
Define industrial/commercial zoned areas in larger acreages for development into planned industrial parks. A possible example is the Hawaiian Homelands property behind the proposed Pahoia fire station. The state and county should encourage partnerships with private investment to achieve this goal	Suggested wording: <i>Commercial and industrial uses should be located at appropriately designated village centers, with the exception of special-purpose industrial uses related to energy production whose use is directly related to the location of the source, such as the geothermal power plant or a potential OTEC facility.</i>
Disallow any industrial/commercial zoning or special use permit in any location substantially separated from other intensive uses to reduce sprawl unless such properties are part of a large planned development that will itself concentrate industrial/commercial land uses in one location	
Investigate such locations as the large geothermal power plant leasehold, Pahoia mauka, DHHL and State of Hawai'i properties for possible industrial parks	
Insure that no strip development occurs along major roads; eliminate any existing illegal commercial development	Suggested wording: <i>Prohibit new development with direct driveway access to a highway. New commercial or industrial development should be visually screened from highway frontages.</i>
Maintain high standards of safe access and green belt setback for all commercial development adjacent to primary highways to minimize traffic safety risks and visual impact. Shipman Industrial Park in Kea'au is a good example of a well planned park	
Insure meaningful buffer space between industrial development and residential or agricultural areas	See comment two lines above.
No special use permit shall be issued that substantively contravenes the 2005 General Plan, PCDP recommendations or generally accepted planning practices	The first of these criteria are already supposed to be taken into account in the review of Special Permits and a public hearing before the Planning Commission is required for the review of an application, so it shouldn't be necessary to state this in the CDP. Following is suggested wording to add the consideration of illegal and nonconforming uses:
All special use permit applicants must demonstrate substantial public need or public interest relating to issues such as safety, public infrastructure or education to justify issuance of a permit for nonconforming uses	<i>Special Permits should not be approved for uses that are not in substantial conformity with the purpose and intent of the Puna Community Development Plan.</i>
Insure that substantial and broad community input be part of any Special Use Permit application	
Require informational form specifying lava, tsunami and subsidence issues of property location	Suggested wording:

Comments/Suggestions re Land Use/Growth Management Working Group Recommendations

<p>as part of land purchase and building permit processes with signed acknowledgment of understanding</p>	<p><i>Require buyers of property and applicants for building permits to sign an acknowledgement of disclosure of risk when the affected land is located within volcanic risk zones 1 or 2, in an area known for having occurrences of subsidence, or within a designated flood or tsunami inundation zone..</i></p>
<p>Indemnify County from any damages resulting from purchasing land or buildings impacted by lava, tsunami or subsidence</p>	<p><i>Require buyers of property and applicants for building permits to sign an acknowledgement of disclosure of risk when the affected land is located within volcanic risk zones 1 or 2, in an area known for having occurrences of subsidence, or within a designated flood or tsunami inundation zone..</i></p>
<p>Impose significantly higher conveyance fee for short term ownership (we suggest less than two years) unless genuine hardship demonstrated or dwelling meets criteria for affordable housing</p>	<p>These two recommendations would require State legislative action. Note: In the 2007 Legislative Session there is an active measure (HB252 HD1 SD1) that would increase the conveyance tax rate on the purchase of residences that are ineligible for homeowner's property tax exemption.</p>
<p>Require building permit for sale of property that can be reasonably construed as having a dwelling</p>	<p>Suggested wording: <i>Seek State legislation imposing a higher conveyance tax rate on properties that are re-sold within a short period, with exceptions for properties providing affordable housing.</i> <i>Seek State legislation requiring that owners of properties occupied by a dwelling show evidence of a building permit for the dwelling prior to closing on the sale of the property.</i></p>
<p>Support affordable housing, either through funding mechanisms for low income or first time buyers, subsidies to affordable housing projects, or other programs to encourage such housing</p>	<p>See comments on Social Services Working Group's recommendations re affordable housing.</p>

Comments/Suggestions re Land Use/Village Centers Working Group Recommendations

LAND USE – VILLAGE CENTERS WORKING GROUP:	COMMENTS/SUGGESTIONS:
<p>County Council should effect a moratorium on all subdividing and any rezoning that would allow development until the Puna Community Development Plan is completed. Special permit requests should be subject to public notice and review, affected community associations' acceptance, and approval by the (to be created) Puna Communities Council</p>	<p>Since this is a measure that would take place prior to the preparation and adoption of the CDP, it should be forwarded to the County Council for consideration.</p>
<p>Communities should first consider the following general criteria and situations as they pertain to their area when exploring village center possibilities:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Set back off highway - Acreage based on population density - Enterprise zone - Access to water, sewer, electric - Roads (into & out of) - Hazards awareness - Proximity to historic/established community areas - Sufficient municipal parking - Ecological, agriculture and archaeological considerations - Impact on community quality of life 	<p>These are good general principles for the location and form of village centers. It may not be necessary to express them in the CDP, since the locations will be mapped and the form will be described according to the location and typology. However, it would be good to define the typology of village centers and explain why they are a key element for the CDP.</p> <p>Suggested wording: <i>Develop a hierarchical typology for village centers based on location, size and functional attributes.</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • <i>Reinforce the role of Puna’s larger existing urban settlements as Regional Village Centers to provide a wide range of services for the Puna district.</i> • <i>Identify Community Village Centers to provide amore limited range of services in smaller existing urban settlements and in large subdivisions that are experiencing the greatest rates of build-out.</i> • <i>Facilitate the development of smaller-scale Neighborhood Village Centers in underserved remote communities and in subdivisions with relatively small lot sizes and significant rates of population growth.</i>
<p>Communities should consider a list of village center "people focused" possible attributes when exploring village center possibilities in their areas</p>	
<p><u>Neighborhood Village Center</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ 5-10 acres ▪ 3,000 population ▪ 5-15 shops such as convenience (prefer Mom & Pop type), food, rugs, personal services <p>Possible Attributes:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Community Flavor- mandatory vs. 7-11 strip mall type flavor ▪ Meeting space/community center- in every neighborhood desired ▪ Social Opportunities- to talk story such as places for chance meetings like central post office box location, neighborhood bulletin boards, community pavilion mandatory ▪ Design District-Maybe too small to institute Design District, on the other hand, Volcano Village good example of where it could work ▪ Farmer’s Market-may be of too big a scale to have in NVC but a few stores w/outside product stands should be allowed ▪ General Store-may be too big for NVC but small mom & pops more desirable, depends what you mean by General Store ▪ Banking-NVC may be too small to support small bank branch but at least one ATM should definitely be provided in NVC ▪ Food-NVC should definitely make provisions for small food establishments such as small mom & pop type like BBQ Chix shops but no major fast food establishments such as Taco Bells should be allowed in NVCs ▪ Green centers- like a small neighborhood park where you could have neighborhood BBQ 	<p>These are appropriate typologies for village centers. The list and description of uses is too detailed for the CDP, but it will be a useful reference for following revisions to the zoning code. Most of the concerns about inappropriate uses – e.g., the incursion of “big box” stores and “fast-food” franchises – can be addressed by legally-defensible design restrictions, such as limitations on floor area and vehicular access. None of the big chains want to locate where they don’t have ready access to the “drive-by” customer.</p> <p>Suggested wording: <u>Neighborhood Village Centers</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • <i>Service Area Population: 3,000 to 6,000 residents</i> • <i>Typical Uses: 5 to15 small tenant spaces for convenience retail and personal services</i> • <i>Land Area: 5-10 acres</i> • <i>Floor Area: Up to 50,000 square feet</i> • <i>Desirable Ancillary or Adjacent Uses: Community facilities such as a park, elementary school, multi-purpose meeting room or, at minimum, a place to congregate or post community notices; areas for outdoor events, such as barbeques and farmer’s markets; small bed-and-breakfast</i>

Comments/Suggestions re Land Use/Village Centers Working Group Recommendations

<p>and covered gathering space should be part of every NVC</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ People pedestrian friendly- shall definitely be an attribute of any village center regardless of size; the most important subattribute of a Village Center being pedestrian friendly is for the village to be safe for pedestrians and should have adequate sidewalks and crosswalks ▪ Small scale accommodations- such as B&B's don't necessarily have to be located in NVC but should be allowed in neighborhoods as long as they meet the normal, "Special Use" zoning requirements ▪ Healthy activities- like walking and biking should be allotted for within every NVC by the use of tree shaded walks, benches and bike parking ▪ Hawaii-Big Island feel design- with height restrictions, environmental building standards, visual guidelines and native landscaping etc should be mandatory for any village center ▪ Multi-family housing- may not be appropriate except for live/work units above small shops in NVC ▪ Medical facilities- like a few small doctor/dentist offices should be allowed within NVC ▪ Cultural opportunities- may be more appropriate in large village centers but small neighborhood coffee shop could be venue for cultural opportunities within NVCs ▪ Smart parking- i.e. parallel in front w/larger parking lot in ancillary locations should be part of NVC such as in Honomu ▪ Transit centers- need to be considered as part of NVC so that commuters could also have easy access to neighborhood stores and services County, State & other public services -may be of too small scale to have in every NVC ▪ Public restrooms- not necessary to provide in every neighborhood but nice if they are as part of park ▪ Live/work concept -like plantation villages should definitely be part of neighborhood village centers such as Papaikou ▪ Security/Neighborhood Watch/Positive police response- shall be part of every neighborhood village center ▪ Education centers/opportunities- would be nice in every neighborhood but may not have facilities, therefore should be relegated to CVC ▪ Legacy- and prepare for future generations should be part of every NVC, therefore plots of land should be set aside for specific uses like parks, community services ▪ Open space preservation- big & little ways should also be part of every NVC, for example, preserve some green buffer zone and wildlife habitat in every neighborhood ▪ Encourage tax \$ to stay in area- by encouraging local businesses to thrive vs. big box stores in every NVC ▪ Business improvement area- see if can get designated Federal dollars to help set infrastructure in place for dedicated community Village Centers as antidote for sprawl and traffic congestion ▪ Lighting- appropriate to the area shall be part of every Neighborhood Village Center, i.e. that is minimally invasive to the environment--lighting that will ensure safety but not pollute the nighttime sky for telescope viewing should be utilized Small business- friendly and conducive atmosphere should be promoted in NVC by limiting big box competition. 	<p><i>homes; transit (or para-transit) stop; connections to walking and bicycling paths.</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • <i>Design Character: Informal, vernacular architecture that is small in scale and reflects a rural residential ambience, using natural exterior materials and earth-tone colors.</i> • <i>Access: Access to a paved road, except that there should be no direct access or visibility from either Highway 11 or Highway 130; no "drive-through" commercial uses are permitted.</i> • <i>Potential Locations: Hawaiian Beaches and Shores, Orchidland, Nanawale, Leilani, Kapoho, Glenwood, and an area between Kaimu and Opihikao. Hawaiian Paradise Park may have a Neighborhood Village Centers in the makai area in addition to the two Community Village Centers in the mauka area of that subdivision.</i>
<p><u>Community Village Center</u></p>	<p>Suggested wording:</p>

Comments/Suggestions re Land Use/Village Centers Working Group Recommendations

- 10-30 acres
 - 15,000 people
 - 20-40 shops such as convenience, soft line, hard line & small appliances
- Possible Attributes:
- Community Flavor- mandatory vs 7-11 strip mall type flavor
 - Meeting space/community center- mandatory for a Community Village Center
 - Social Opportunities- to talk story such as places for chance meetings like central post office boxes location, neighborhood bulletin boards, community pavilions & gardens, mandatory
 - Design District-medium sized Village Center should definitely consider having mandatory Design District Guidelines to make sure all the buildings in the CVC look cohesive and of the area rather than imported Subway, for example type buildings
 - Farmer’s Market -definitely appropriate in Community Village Centers because will have critical mass to support market. For example, Maku’u Farmer’s Market General Store- definitely appropriate here, e.g. Ace or True Value Hardware, J. Hara’s
 - Banking-small bank branch should definitely be provided in Community Village Center, for example BOH and 1st Hawaiian in Pahoia--but needed also in Mt. View
 - Food-medium sized food establishments such as coffeeshops, plate lunch establishments that reflect the community should be allowed in CVC
 - Green centers- should also be part of every community village center; village greens should be the size to have a couple of ball fields, dog park, recreation activities, a covered gathering space etc.
 - People pedestrian friendly- shall definitely be part of any village center regardless of size-- the most important subattribute of a Village Center being pedestrian friendly is for the village to be safe for pedestrians and should have adequate sidewalks and crosswalks
 - Small scale accommodations- such as B&B’s don’t necessarily have to be located in CVC but should be allowed w/I the community as long as they meet the normal, “Special Use” zoning requirements
 - Healthy activities- like walking and biking should be allotted for within every Community Village Center by the use of tree shaded walks, benches and bike parking
 - Hawaii-Big Island feel design- with height restrictions, environmental building standards, visual guidelines and native landscaping etc should be mandatory for any village center
 - Multi-family housing- may be more appropriate such as live/work units above small shops in CVC
 - Medical facilities- like a few small doctor/dentist offices and maybe a small but not too large clinic should be allowed within CVC
 - Cultural opportunities- in small to medium sized venues such as coffee house size up to small theater should be considered for CVCs
 - Smart parking- i.e. parallel in front w/larger parking lot in ancillary locations should be part of CVC such as in Honoka’a
 - Transit centers- need to be considered as part of CVC so that commuters could also have easy access to community stores and services, i.e. medium sized stores, services near bus stop
 - County, State & other public services- such as small scale Police substation should be considered as part of CVC
 - Public restrooms- nice to provide as part of Community Village Centers Park

- Community Village Centers
- *Service Area Population: 7,000 to 15,000 residents*
 - *Typical Uses: 20 to 40 small tenant spaces for retail and personal services, repair shops*
 - *Land Area: 10-30 acres*
 - *Floor Area: Up to 150,000 square feet aggregate, but no tenant spaces larger than 25,000 square feet.*
 - *Other Uses: A park, elementary or middle school, community center and outdoor events area; bed-and-breakfast homes and small inns; elderly or other special needs housing; transit stop; medical clinic; walking and bicycling paths.*
 - *Design Character: Informal, vernacular architecture that is small in scale, utilizes natural exterior materials and earth-tone colors, and respects the context of the built form of the community, especially where historic structures are present, such as in Volcano Village and, to some extent, in Mountain View.*
 - *Access: Access to one or more paved roads; commercial or public uses may be visible from Highway 11 or Highway 130, but may not have direct driveway access to or from these highways; no “drive-through” commercial uses are permitted.*
 - *Locations: Ainaloa, Kurtistown, Mountain View, Hawaiian Paradise Park (no more than two locations), and Volcano.*

Comments/Suggestions re Land Use/Village Centers Working Group Recommendations

<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Live/work concept- like plantation villages should definitely be part of community village centers such as Papaikou ▪ Security/Neighborhood Watch/Positive police response- shall be part of every community village center with possible mini police substation and security video cameras ▪ Education centers/opportunities -would be nice in every community, therefore should be mandated in CVC ▪ Legacy- and prepare for future generations should be part of every CVC, therefore plots of land should be set aside for specific uses like parks, community services ▪ Open space preservation- big & little ways should also be part of every CVC, for example preserve a medium sized green buffer zone and wildlife habitat in every community ▪ Encourage tax \$- to stay in area by encouraging local businesses to thrive vs. big box stores in every CVC ▪ Business improvement area- See if can get designated Federal dollars to help set infrastructure in place for dedicated Community Village Centers as antidote for sprawl and traffic congestion ▪ Lighting- appropriate to the area shall be part of every Community Village Center, i.e. that is minimally invasive to the environment--lighting that will ensure safety but not pollute the nighttime sky for telescope viewing should be utilized ▪ Small business friendly- and conducive atmosphere should be promoted in CVC by limiting big box competition 	
<p><u>Regional Commercial Center</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ > 30 acres ▪ 50,000 population ▪ > 40 shops, full range of merchandise & services <p>Possible Attributes:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Community flavor- mandatory vs 7-11 strip mall flavor ▪ Meeting space/community center- mandatory, at least one for Town Hall type meetings ▪ Social Opportunities- to talk story such as places for chance meetings like post office boxes, neighborhood bulletin boards, community pavilions & gardens mandatory ▪ Design District-having a design district for the Regional Village Centers will enhance the sense of place and cohesive architectural design will unify the community and could only increase property values; for example Waimea vs. Walmart/Hilo ▪ Farmer's Market- definitely appropriate here; for example, Kea'au Farmer's Market ▪ General Stores- may get sized out by larger stores in Regional Village Center ▪ Banking-Regular size bank branches as well as alternatives such as Credit Unions should be provided in Regional Village Centers such as Kea'au ▪ Food-Large food establishments such as McDonalds, Pizza Hut should be and are already allowed in Regional Village Centers such as Kea'au Shopping Center Green centers such as W.H. Shipman Regional Park should be part of every Regional Village Center; the green centers to be considered should be of the recreation complex size. ▪ People pedestrian friendly- shall definitely be part of any village center regardless of size; the most important sub-attribute of a Village Center being pedestrian friendly is for the village to be safe for pedestrians and should have adequate sidewalks and crosswalks. ▪ Small scale accommodations- such as B&B's don't necessarily have to be located in RVC but should be allowed in the region as long as they meet the normal "Special Use" zoning 	<p>Suggested wording:</p> <p><u>Regional Village Centers</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • <i>Service Area Population: 35,000 to 50,000 residents</i> • <i>Typical Uses: More than 40 tenant spaces for full range of retail and personal services, repair shops and other light industrial uses</i> • <i>Land Area: More than 30 acres</i> • <i>Floor Area: Up to 250,000 square feet aggregate, but no tenant spaces larger than 50,000 square feet.</i> • <i>Other Uses: A regional park; schools for all grade levels; community hall, theater and outdoor events area; bed-and-breakfast homes and small inns; elderly or other special needs housing; transit hub; medical facility with emergency room; police and fire station; walking and bicycling paths.</i> • <i>Design Character: Vernacular architecture that respects the historic context and scale of the community; specific locations on the periphery of the Village Center are designated for light industrial uses to avoid building forms or activities that might detract from or conflict with the desired pedestrian-oriented character in the core of the Village Center; small repair shops may be permitted in the Village Center core subject to performance and design criteria.</i> • <i>Access: Access to one or more paved roads; commercial or public uses may be visible from Highway 11 or Highway 130, but may not have direct driveway access to or from these highways.</i> • <i>Locations: Kea'au, Pahoa.</i>

Comments/Suggestions re Land Use/Village Centers Working Group Recommendations

requirements

- Healthy activities- like walking and biking should be allotted for within every Regional Village Center by the use of tree shaded walks, benches and bike parking.
- Hawaii-Big Island feel design- with height restrictions, environmental building standards, visual guidelines and native landscaping etc should be mandatory for any village center
- Multi-family housing- definitely appropriate in RVC especially live/work units above small shops
- Medical facilities- including small clinic/hospital should be allowed, planned for and mandated within RVC
- Cultural opportunities- in medium to large sized venues such as small theater to large auditorium should be considered for RVCs
- Smart parking- i.e. parallel in front w/large parking lot in ancillary location should be part of RVC such as in Hilo
- Transit centers- need to be considered as part of RVC so that commuters could also have easy access to community stores and services, i.e. large sized stores, services near bus transfer station like Ala Moana
- County, State & other public services- shall definitely be provided in “second city” offices of RVC
- Public restrooms- nice to provide as part of RVC but will most likely be in multiple places such as public buildings
- Live/work concept- like plantation villages should definitely be part of regional village centers such as Papaikou
- Security/Neighborhood Watch/Positive police response- shall be part of every be part of every community village center with possible mini police substation and security video cameras
- Education centers/opportunities- mandatory in every RVC so that one doesn’t have to travel great distances for education
- Legacy- and prepare for future generations should be part of every RVC, therefore; plots of land should be set aside for specific uses like parks, community services
- Open space preservation- big & little ways should also be part of every RVC, for example preserve a large green buffer zone and wildlife habitat in every region
- Encourage tax \$- to stay in area by encouraging local businesses to thrive vs. big box stores in every RVC
- Business improvement area- see if can get designated Federal dollars to help set infrastructure in place for dedicated Regional Village Centers as antidote for sprawl and traffic congestion
- Lighting- appropriate to the area shall be part of every RVC, i.e. that is minimally invasive to the environment--lighting that will ensure safety but not pollute the nighttime sky for telescope viewing should be utilized.
- Small business friendly- and conducive atmosphere should be promoted in RVC by limiting big box competition
- In general, light industry would not be encouraged in the core of the village center. Noise, space, visual characteristics and air quality impact should relegate much of light industry away from the core of a village center or to a separate location. The General Plan should continue to identify appropriate locations for light industry subject to smart planning

Special Districts include village centers where the built form exhibits characteristics that reflect that place’s history and/or natural setting. They may encompass residential as well as commercial and public uses. The strongest village center candidates for Special District designation in Puna are:

- *Volcano Village, where there is presently a small, legally recognized historic district and a 1993 inventory by the Hawai’i State Historic Division identifies as having a high concentration of historic structures, serving as a basis for establishing both the boundaries of the Special Design District and the design parameters for development within it;*
- *Pahoa Village, where the main street (former highway route before the construction of the by-pass road) still retains much of the original streetwall of plantation-era structures, as well as some significant public buildings.*

Either the County or a community organization may initiate the process to establish a Special Design District. The following items should be addressed for candidate areas:

- *Define the distinctive characteristics or historical sites to be preserved or enhanced;*
- *Identify the existing or desired focal points for community activity;*
- *Recommend whether the design guidelines should apply to residential as well as commercial and public buildings;*
- *Identify the features to be preserved or enhanced;*
- *Identify features that are incompatible with the desired character of the village;*
- *Recommend guidelines for infill development;*
- *Recommend what use should be prohibited;*
- *Recommend the extent to which regulatory controls are needed as opposed to voluntary guidelines;*
- *Recommend whether regulatory controls should be specific, prescriptive design standards or more general design principles coupled with a design review process;*
- *Recommend who should be responsible for design review and decisions and/or promoting compliance with voluntary guidelines.*

Comments/Suggestions re Land Use/Village Centers Working Group Recommendations

<p>principles and allow appropriate special permits where the industry's impact does not conflict with the level and type of other development planned. Suitable design considerations are needed when the light industry facility is situated in a design district</p>	
<p>Village Center Locations by Type:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Kea’au - Regional Village Center - Pahoia - Regional Village Center - Haw’n Shores/Beaches - Neighborhood Village Center - Kaimu to Opihikao - Neighborhood Village Center w/ Black Sand, Kehena, Kaimu, Puna Beach Palisades, Seaview, Royal Gardens as catchment or feeder areas - Nanawale - Neighborhood Village Center - Leilani Estates - Neighborhood Village Center - Glenwood - Neighborhood Village Center w/ Fern Forest, Orchid Isle Estates, Eden Roc & Aloha Estates as catchment or feeder areas - Kurtistown - Community Village Center w/ Hawaiian Acres as a catchment or feeder area - Mt. View - Community Village Center w/Pacific Paradise Mt. View Manor, Eden Roc, Fern Acres, Hawaiian Acres, Aloha Estates, Ola’a Scenic Lands, Hawaiian Island Paradise, Hilo Acres, Pacific Paradise Development as catchment or feeder areas - Orchidland - Neighborhood Village Center - HPP - Community Village Center - Volcano - Community Village Center w/ Royal Hawaiian, Ohia Estates, Volcano Village, Hawaiian Orchid Island, Mauna Loa Estates & Volcano Golf & Country Club as catchment or feeder areas - Ainaloa - Community Village Center w/ Tiki Gardens & Hawaiian Acres as catchment or feeder areas - Kapoho - Neighborhood Village Center 	<p>These recommended locations are incorporated into the above descriptions of Regional, Community and Neighborhood Village Centers.</p>
<p>Communities should consider their area location, population base with build-out, general characteristics, and geographical situation in relation to other Puna neighborhoods when exploring scope and size of village centers. Using these criteria, potential general locations in Puna are listed below and a suggested type of village center for each. These may be appropriate for servicing that immediate and surrounding area and reducing congestion and long distance driving</p>	<p>It would be useful to recognize that there are some existing village centers as well as proposed new locations for village centers. Strategies for County support and assistance for village center expansion, enhancement or creation will vary, depending on the location.</p>
<p>Commercial zoning for village centers should be allocated based on the goals of the community, population and general criteria in III.B. Note: Commercial zoning deficiencies in Puna were depicted in the 1992 Community Development Plan Technical Report: Puna has 2.84 acres per 1,000 population yet the islandwide ratio is 10.77 acres per 1000</p>	<p>Suggested wording: <i>For established village centers – i.e., where there are at least three or more adjacent commercial uses or community facilities as identified on the Land Use Map – the County will support the expansion and/or enhancement of these centers by:</i></p>
<p>Wherever infrastructure is unavailable for needed commercial development of village centers the county will support infrastructure alternatives that satisfy the needs for development and public health and safety, i.e., solar energy and well or catchment water systems that meet health and safety standards</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • <i>Providing commercial zoning or use permits for existing uses that do not presently have appropriate entitlements, and for proposed uses at appropriate nearby locations, provided that the size and use of the expansion area conforms to the criteria applicable to the type of village center at that location;</i>
<p>If stakeholders or area residents desire to have a village center or design district they should notify county planning authorities. The county should prepare and make information available about collaborative community driven planning processes (including design warranted variance requests) and how to initiate them to ensure community desires are implemented</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • <i>Revising zoning and development codes, as necessary, to conform to and implement the use and design criteria described for each of the village center types, and for village centers that are proposed for Special Design</i>

Comments/Suggestions re Land Use/Village Centers Working Group Recommendations

<p>A Puna district-wide set of broad design guidelines should be established and adopted in the General Plan that applies to all Puna design districts to ensure development and preservation efforts are locale based and consistent with Hawaiian characteristics. Individual communities should then be able to create specific design guidelines for voluntary compliance or seek regulatory design standards if so desired. Both commercial and residential areas can consider using the design district concept to provide a workable and positive direction to achieve development and community identity goals</p>	<p><i>center types, and for village centers that are proposed for Special Design District treatment;</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • <i>Facilitating the development of a pedestrian-supportive environment by investing in walkways, bicycle facilities, “park-once” lots, landscape improvements, themed signage programs and transit stops in the village center;</i> • <i>Encouraging the State to locate its community facilities, such as public schools, in designated village centers, and to design them in conformance to the criteria applicable to the type of village center at that location.</i>
<p>County design district processes and guidelines should conform to state law (Act 119, SLH 1973) which requires counties to adopt urban and rural design plans based on:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Land Use ▪ Pedestrian and vehicular circulation ▪ Public and private community services ▪ Historic sites ▪ Significant land and water features ▪ View and vistas ▪ Basic concepts of environmental and architectural character 	<p>The following outlines how new village centers may be established in existing subdivisions. The third bullet, below, is relates to an issue that has not been identified by any of the WGs – i.e., the auctioning of lots that are in foreclosure due to non-payment of property taxes. Between 1990 and 2006, approximately 1,123 lots in Puna were auctioned in such foreclosures. About half were sold to buyers of multiple lots, most likely for speculative re-sale and/or building. This practice contributes to the growth pressure and land price inflation in Puna. If the County held rather than immediately auctioned these properties, the properties could be used as relocation or land-swaps for acquiring need public rights-of-way, public facilities and village center formation.</p>
<p>The following key questions should be considered by communities to explore their design district potential (condensed from a guide written by John Whalen):</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ What distinctive characteristics or historical sites in their community do they wish to preserve or enhance? ▪ What are the existing or desired focal points for community activity? ▪ Would the design guidelines apply to residential as well as commercial and public buildings? ▪ What features should be preserved or enhanced? ▪ What features are incompatible with the desired character of the village? ▪ What should be the guidelines for infill development? ▪ Is it possible (or necessary) to prohibit undesirable uses? ▪ Would there be regulatory controls or voluntary guidelines? ▪ If regulatory controls, would there be specific, prescriptive design standards or more general design principles coupled with a design review process? ▪ Who would be responsible for design review and decisions? ▪ If the guidelines are voluntary, how will they be promoted? 	<p><i>New village centers may be proposed by a landowner or group of landowners within a subdivision, provided that the location is in general conformance with the Land Use Map and the proposed size and use characteristics are consistent with the criteria for a Community Village Center or Neighborhood Village Center, as described above. The County will assist in the formation of a village center by:</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • <i>Providing technical assistance to community organizations and partnerships of existing landowners of a subdivision who wish to assemble lots for the site of a village center by means of landpooling or transfer of development rights;</i> • <i>Providing loan guarantees or assisting in securing loan guarantees by other governmental and non-profit organizations for the development of necessary infrastructure for the village center;</i> • <i>Retaining lots that are in foreclosure for delinquent real property tax payments rather than having them auctioned for sale to the highest bidder, so that they can be used for relocation purposes when other properties are acquired for future rights-of-way, public facilities or land assembly related to village center development;</i> • <i>Investing in public facilities, such as public parks and transit stops, as appropriate to the use and design criteria that are applicable to the type of village center being created.</i>
<p>The county should take necessary steps to process community association approved design district proposals to completion when submitted for Puna communities as long as they meet current existing laws and standards and the intent of the CDP.</p>	<p><i>Investing in public facilities, such as public parks and transit stops, as appropriate to the use and design criteria that are applicable to the type of village center being created.</i></p>

Comments/Suggestions re Land Use/Village Centers Working Group Recommendations

<p>Create a Puna Communities Council, that with the assistance of a planning consultant will do the following in Puna related matters:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">▪ Review proposed General Plan changes and rezoning requests▪ Be involved in creating county design district processes▪ Assist in development of Puna wide broad design district guidelines▪ Have first tier approval authority for community based new (regulated) design district proposals and subsequent guideline revision requests▪ Have first tier approval authority for special permit requests	<p>The proposal for a Puna Communities Council appears in several of the WG reports, sometimes by a different name or with a different function and organizational structure. Rather than respond to each WG's proposal, there is suggested wording in the introduction to this table that attempts to describe the purpose and structure of a "Puna Communities Council" based on the combined proposals of the different WGs.</p>
---	---

Comments/Suggestions re Land Use/Preserving Land, Air and Water Working Group Recommendations

LAND USE/PRESERVING LAND, AIR, AND WATER WORKING GROUP:	COMMENTS/SUGGESTIONS:
<p>Support viable existing programs to preserve trees and open space and to establish planting corridors (See Bill 1231, Hawaii County Council 1-4-07, to add to Chapter 25, Article 6, Hawaii County Code 1983 (2005 Edition), "Division 6. Scenic Corridors," which delineates criteria and procedures for establishing initiating scenic corridors.)</p>	<p>Since the enabling legislation to define and establish Scenic Corridors is in process, the CDP language could assume that this has been adopted and address the specific candidate corridor in Puna, as follows:</p>
<p>Include the actions below in strategies for retaining open space on Highway 137, ocean side corridor</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Establish 15-foot planting easements on road frontage of private lots. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Encourage retention of native and large standing trees (excluding invasive species such as strawberry guava, albizzia, gunpowder, etc) - Award tax credits based on square footage in planting easement deducted from the lot size - Provide recognition through landscape commendation awards given to owners who retain trees, which could be referenced if the property is listed for sale - Extend the above incentives to property owners who replant easements already cleared, preferably with native species, and stipulate without suing invasive species, as designated in Weed Risk Assessment - Instruct the departments of county planning and building to provide property owners with lists of recommended native and food trees suitable for planting at roadside easements - Establish a law requiring the 15 foot mauka/makai boundary line to be kept open, un-gated, and unfenced to guarantee access to the shoreline ▪ Establish markers and small visitor parking areas at historical sites, such as the two Kehena area sites listed in the General Plan. Neither site is marked, and an adjacent property owner is using one of the areas as an extension of his lawn. ▪ Create vista pullouts along Hwy 137 so tourists and residents can safely view the beautiful scenery ▪ Mark and retain easement paths to the ocean from Hwy 137 by measuring the width of the Red Road and doing a rough mapping ▪ Reduce width of tree cutbacks needed to accommodate power lines ▪ Establish a law requiring the 15' mauka/makai boundary line to be kept open, ungated, and unfenced to guarantee access to the shoreline ▪ Identify a few special places at which to bury power lines along Highway 137 ▪ Preserve mangos, Kamani groves, and monkey pod tree tunnels. ▪ Limit street lights to areas where they are essential for safety, such as at major intersections with Hwy 137, and educate coastline residents about how to reduce illumination of driveway lights on private land 	<p><i>Designate Highway 137 for Scenic Corridor status and initiate the following measures to enhance the scenic value of this corridor:</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • <i>Require a 15-foot easement along the frontage of private properties along the corridor within which native and mature trees of non-invasive species must be retained, unless they are in poor health due to natural conditions, not due to malicious acts, and/or pose a threat to public health and safety;</i> • <i>Preserve Mango, Kamani, and Monkeypod groves and tree tunnels;</i> • <i>Provide property tax relief to owners who maintain the easement in the manner intended and State tax credits to those who replant easements with non-invasive plant material approved by the County;</i> • <i>Add interpretive markers and small visitor parking areas at historical sites, such as the two Kehena sites listed in the General Plan;</i> • <i>Provide pullouts along the highway at intervals so that travelers can stop to enjoy the scenery without conflict with traffic in travel lanes;</i> • <i>Delineate and maintain physical access to the shoreline on the makai side of the road;</i> • <i>Minimize tree pruning by using special, shielded cable for overhead utility lines or by undergrounding sections of the line;</i> • <i>Minimize excessive lighting by limiting street lights to major intersections and informing residents along the corridor about how to reduce illumination of driveways.</i> • <i>Add a restroom and emergency phone below Seaview before Kehena Beach;</i> • <i>Create a simple walking trail on the lava and new parking area with restrooms on the State owned accretion land at the new Kaimu Beach;</i> • <i>Posting warning signs, where appropriate, in newly realigned sections</i> • <i>Cover old section of road with cinder soil to allow Naupaka to reclaim the land.</i>
<p>Track and provide comments on proposals related to Land Use, including, but not limited to: A. Proposals for commercial development and/or zoning; village centers, etc; B. Ordinances to change State Land Use and LUPAG to ensure consistency with the PCDP; C. New or existing ordinances or rules that need to be enacted or amended; and D. Budgetary items related to operational and CIP requests to implement PCDP priorities</p>	<p>Not sure these need to be stated in the CDP, since they need to be done as a matter of course.</p>
<p>Prohibit commercial development along Highway 11 from the 15 mile mark to Volcanoes National Park</p>	<p>See comments/suggestions to Land Use/Growth Management WG.</p>
<p>Build a new school in Mountain View away from the highway. Potential locations are being</p>	<p>This would have been an appropriate recommendation from the Public</p>

Comments/Suggestions re Land Use/Preserving Land, Air and Water Working Group Recommendations

<p>explored; others locations should be sought. Convert the current school to a community center serving neighboring communities from Glenwood to Hawaiian Acres.</p>	<p>Infrastructure WG. Since they submitted only a partial report, below is suggested wording to incorporate this recommendation in the CDP:</p> <p><i>Build a new school in Mountain View away from the highway, optimally within the Mountain View Community Village Center or another nearby designated village center. Convert the current school to a community center serving Glenwood to Hawaiian Acres.</i></p>
<p>Provide incentives for organic agriculture, such as establishing sustainable agricultural parks and programs in which land owners can offer unused portions of their usable agriculture land to interested individuals. (Example: In Mountain View, many farmers and landowners are retired, so lands are overgrown. People interested in agriculture could help developers with approval to build on productive agricultural lands to come into compliance with zoning requirements. The County could help by offering tax breaks to cooperating landowners.)</p>	<p>See comments/suggestions to Agriculture WG.</p>
<p>Reevaluate (and, where desirable, revise) existing codes and then require adherence, with no possibility of “after the fact” rezoning</p> <p>Require, without exception, that grubbing/grading permits be submitted with the building permit</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Impose a 10-year waiting period for reapplication for those who do not submit grubbing/grading permits with the building permit 	<p>See comments/suggestions below re procedures for grading and building permits and violations.</p>
<p>Maintain or create zoning codes to provide disincentives for buying land with the intent to subdivide and resell (Proposals for provision(s) need to deal separately ‘zoning’ and ‘subdividing,’ because they are in different chapters in the County Code.)</p>	<p>See comments/suggestions to Land Use/Growth Management and Land Use/Village Centers WGs re land speculation and auctioning of foreclosed properties that are delinquent on real property taxes.</p>
<p>Develop a strategy for getting the County Council to pass an ordinance within 18 months or sooner to reasonably limit the amount of a residential, urban or agricultural lot that can be cleared of native forest or preferred species</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Include in the ordinance a specific variance or use permit that would allow requests for clearing a greater area for bona fide agricultural purposes. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Notify property owners adjacent to the property that the owner is applying for a grubbing/bulldozing/building permit with a variance to the tree ordinance. - Require the owner to post in several visible locations a copy of the application for a grubbing/bulldozing/building permit with a variance to the tree ordinance, with a 30-day period for community response. The posted tree map submitted with permit applications by the land owner can be used by neighbors to report lack of adherence with the variance, if granted. - Owners giving false information on an application will not be allowed to resubmit on application for one year. - Bulldozer operators who violate the tree ordinance will lose their license for one year. ▪ Require a grading plan and permit for all lots greater than 10,000 square feet. ▪ Require property owners to indicate on a Tax Key Map all trees meeting protection criteria (such as measuring trees at four feet above the ground) and then to submit a grubbing/bulldozing/building permit describing the exceptions, with specific reasons for wanting to cut specific trees ▪ Prepare a map of the best remaining native vegetation in lower to mid Puna (where the threat is the greatest and the remainder is the least) and make it available to county officials to use to prioritize specific areas to protect. ▪ Lobby appropriate agencies to move forward with developing a map 	<p>See comments/suggestions to Natural Resources Preservation WG.</p>

Comments/Suggestions re Land Use/Preserving Land, Air and Water Working Group Recommendations

<p>Require environmental education, via programs and print materials, prior to approving permits to clear land, cut and/or transport precious natural resources, etc</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Develop an ordinance to create an outreach department within County government that educates anyone looking for or required to have some knowledge about the land, or, and water; especially prior to breaking ground on unspoiled land 	
<p>Incorporate the Following Specific Activities into PCDP Recommendations</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Limit subdividing AG land in lava zones 1 and 2 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Prohibit subdividing Ag lands into parcels smaller than 5 acres ▪ Establish percentage limits on clear cutting that can be done on AG and urban land parcels ▪ Require evaluation by a Forester or other professional government employee when special permits and variances are requested ▪ Create Ahupua'a based planning to coordinate water flow and sheet flow during heavy rains common to the area ▪ Ease building codes to allow for "lighter" buildings, such as structural bamboo ○ Mitigate threats to forest birds <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Learn how to share the habitat of forest birds. ▪ Minimize the removal of native trees and shrubs and plant native trees and shrubs that provide food and shelter to birds ▪ Educate neighborhoods on how to coordinate their plantings to increase the abundance and diversity of plant species ○ Require land use plans to incorporate requirements related to trees for oxygen production <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Require parks to have trees, in addition to grassy areas. ▪ Provide guides to prevent "over trimming" of trees in parks and county lands ▪ Provide property tax credits to reward reforestation efforts with native and preferred species on private and commercial lands ○ Honor the original intention of CZM and SMA legislation to protect the natural beauty of the land ○ Prohibit expansion of military bases on the island and all military activities that impact negatively on the land, air, and water <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Prohibit use of depleted uranium in any form on the island (see resource list) ▪ Develop legislation to have Hawaii designated as a Nuclear-Free Zone ▪ Prohibit designation of additional bombing or live ordinance sites on this island ▪ Prohibit acquisition of additional land on this island for military use ○ Conduct air quality testing with oxygen readings at grade school to monitor contaminants, including car exhaust from roads ○ Prohibit destruction of unique geological features such as spatter cones, pit craters, and lava tubes and collapsed lava tubes and provide incentives for protecting these features <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Do not allow permits, even on private land, to destroy or significantly alter these features ▪ Provide a tax credit for the footage occupied by these features, since it cannot be developed ○ Broaden the mail-out notification distance required for a zoning change application to prevent undue influence by a small group of people who might benefit from a decision that impacts a larger area. 	<p>Some of these recommendations are addressed in responses to several other WGs, even if indirectly. For example, threats to forest birds are mitigated by CDP measures intended to preserve their habitat, the native forest. Similarly, creation of a County Forester position (see Natural Resources Protection WG) will hopefully lead to better tree planting and maintenance practices in County parks.</p> <p>A couple of the recommendations are probably not appropriate to include in the CDP because they would have virtually no effect or purpose. For example, the CDP is not an appropriate vehicle to reprimand or remind officials about the intent of the CZM or SMA. Likewise, statements about military activities in the CDP would have no effect, since County ordinances cannot control these activities. It would be more effective to use existing procedures, such as Chapter 343, NEPA and required public hearings to voice these concerns with respect to specific proposed actions. All of these procedures contain "cause of action" provisions that allow legal challenges to proposed actions and decisions. Organizations such as Earthjustice know them quite well and use them often to great effect.</p> <p>See the response to the Natural Resource Preservation WG's recommendations re the grading ordinance for suggested wording to address the protection of unique geological features.</p> <p>With respect to flooding, the following suggested wording broadens the scope by calling for a comprehensive watershed management approach: <i>Develop a watershed management plan for Puna's central corridor in coordination with the Department of Water, Department of Public Works, Department of Land and Natural Resources, Department of Health, Corps of Engineers and Soil and Water Conservation District with the following objectives:</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● <i>Mitigation of localized flooding during heavy rains;</i> ● <i>Protection of existing and potential potable water supply from contamination;</i> ● <i>Protection of coastal water quality;</i> ● <i>Conservation of water supply for agricultural purposes;</i> ● <i>Management of water resources based on the ahupua'a model and Best Management Practices.</i> <p>One of the WG's recommendations – to amend the Building Code to allow the use of "lighter" structures in high seismic/volcanic risk zones – could</p>

Comments/Suggestions re Land Use/Preserving Land, Air and Water Working Group Recommendations

be expanded to include consideration of indigenous Hawaiian architecture. Maui County has adopted standards (sometimes referred to as the “Kanaka Code”) for structures utilizing traditional Hawaiian building design and construction methods and materials, which in essentially result in lighter structures. For details, drawings and limitations on use, see:

<http://www.co.maui.hi.us/departments/Public/pdf/IHASTructures.pdf>

Suggested wording re building code standards:

Consider the adoption of building code amendments to allow structures utilizing architectural practices, customs, styles, and techniques historically employed by the native residents of the Hawaiian Islands, including structures comprised of either rock walls or wood frames for the bottom portion of structures and thatch of different native grasses and leaves for the roof.. The purpose is to promote cultural, environmental, and historic preservation; energy efficiency; economic development; aesthetic beauty; and public safety.

Comments/Suggestions re Land Use/Biosphere Reserve Protection Zone Working Group Recommendations

LAND USE/BIOSPHERE RESERVE PROTECTION ZONE WORKING GROUP:	COMMENTS/SUGGESTIONS:
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Amend the Hawai'i County Code (HCC), Article 7 (relating to Special District Regulations), to add sections that will establish and manage a Special District called the Biosphere Reserve Buffer Zone District as per Objectives 1-5 above. This will include the establishment of a Biosphere Reserve Buffer Zone Advisory Commission to act as the interface between the Volcano area community and the Hawai'i County agencies affected by the operations of the Biosphere Reserve Buffer Zone District 	<p>Some elements of this proposal would be more appropriate to include in the amendment to the County Code rather than the CDP because of their highly specific, regulatory language. Since some of these initiatives can be accomplished in other ways or broadened to apply to areas outside of the proposed Biosphere Reserve Buffer Zone, it would be desirable to leave some latitude for this. For example, the district-wide rezoning that was suggested in response to the Agriculture WG will greatly reduce development potential in the BRBZ. The specific language of BRBZ WG recommendation, however, is a good starting point for the development of a regulatory ordinance.</p> <p>Suggested wording:</p> <p><i>Amend the Hawai'i County Code to create a Biosphere Reserve Buffer Zone (BRBZ) in the area defined by Figure __ [Map provided by Rick Warshauer.] The purpose of the BRBZ is to sustain the health of the native forest in areas adjoining the Volcanoes National Park and State Forest Reserves by minimizing development that reduces the forest cover, while allowing reasonable use of properties. The BRBZ ordinance shall include:</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • <i>Prohibition of additional farm dwelling and 'ohana dwelling permits;</i> • <i>Strict criteria for subdivision of land;</i> • <i>Prohibition of zoning to more intensive classifications, unless part of a transfer of development rights or land pooling agreement that reallocates development rights from one property to another to achieve better protection of the native forest;</i> • <i>Limits on the clearance of natural vegetation on lots, building footprints and other impervious surfaces, such as driveways, parking lots and paved lanai;</i> • <i>Restrictions on the removal, destructive pruning or other malicious treatment of healthy 'Ohi'a trees within required lot setback areas;</i> • <i>Creation of an advisory body composed of qualified biologists and those in allied professions to review and make recommendations on standards, guidelines and applications for development in the BRBZ;</i> • <i>Provisions for civil fine penalties for violations of the BRBZ, with proceeds of the fines to be set aside in the special fund for purchasing property rights within the BRBZ.</i>
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Pass an ordinance that would direct the Planning Director not to accept or process applications for subdivisions (including for consolidation/re-subdivision), additional farm dwelling or 'ohana dwelling permits within the Biosphere Reserve Buffer Zone District. The only exceptions would be applications for subdivision (including for consolidation/re-subdivision) that had received a positive recommendation from the Biosphere Reserve Buffer Zone Advisory Commission 	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Pass an ordinance that would direct the Hawai'i County Finance Department to establish procedures that will allow property owners within the Biosphere Reserve Buffer Zone District to receive a permanent, low tax assessment in exchange for establishing a permanent restriction prohibiting any construction or development of their dedicated parcels. Instruments to establish this prohibition shall include Conservation Easements (as delineated in Hawai'i Revised Statutes Chapter 198), non-retractable deed restriction, or similar measure. The collective reduction in taxes paid should be reflected in the reduction of County services for the collective avoided development in the District 	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Pass an ordinance that would direct and fund the Planning Director to commission a study to develop procedures to legally institute the processes of "Transfer of Development Rights" and "Land Pooling" within the Biosphere Reserve Buffer Zone District and to investigate other measures to redistribute development type and density 	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Pass an ordinance that would direct the Planning Director not to accept or process applications for changes of zone within the Biosphere Reserve Buffer Zone District that would increase the building density or allowable uses above those allowed in residential and agricultural zones. The only exceptions would be applications within the context of Transfer of Development Rights and/or Land Pooling, and which had received a positive recommendation from the Biosphere Reserve Buffer Zone Advisory Commission 	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Pass an ordinance that would direct the Hawai'i County Public Works and Planning Departments to prohibit any mechanical land clearing or removal of healthy 'ohi'a trees within required building site yard areas of properties within the Biosphere Reserve Buffer Zone District, except for a single fifteen-foot wide driveway access. This ordinance should include a \$10,000 fine (each, per violation) for violating owners and equipment operators, and an efficient process to collect the fine. These fines would be directed into a fund to be set up for purchasing property rights within the Biosphere Reserve Buffer Zone District 	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Pass a Biosphere Reserve Buffer Zone District general construction ordinance which would establish standards for maximum building footprint, impervious surface, vegetation clearance and land surface disturbance within the buffer zone district with the objective of allowing reasonable use of property and structures while not diminishing the larger goal of protecting the natural resources and ohia canopy of the Biosphere Reserve Buffer Zone District. 	

Comments/Suggestions re Land Use/Biosphere Reserve Protection Zone Working Group Recommendations

<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Pass an ordinance that would phase out the currently required (and destructive) leach field septic system design and instead, Hawai'i County Public Works and Planning Departments should accept alternative and experimental septic system effluent disposal methods using a small-footprint design that are approved by the State Department of Health. 	<p>Suggested wording: <i>Allow and encourage the use of small-footprint wastewater system designs as an alternative to land-extensive leach field septic systems, provided that such alternative systems are acceptable to the Hawai'i Department of Health.</i></p>
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Pass an ordinance that would direct and fund the Planning Director to commission a study to develop procedures to allow small-scale development that does not require a change of zone. These procedures should include Use Permit, Special Permit, Planned Unit Development, and similar current and/or not yet codified procedures. For all measures, resulting permits shall not run with the land. The goals would be to allow needed small-scale development in areas of predominantly agricultural and residential zoning without encouraging land speculation that is associated with up-zoning. 	<p>This recommendation is addressed in the suggested wording for the BRBZ ordinance (see above.)</p>
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Pass an ordinance that would direct and fund the Public Works Director to commission a study to identify the flood paths and source areas in the Biosphere Reserve Buffer Zone District, and to design and recommend ordinance language to implement innovative ways to reduce the scale and impacts of flooding, including the acquisition of or rights to strategic vacant, forested lots to use for absorbing floodwaters. 	<p>This recommendation is addressed in the response to the Land Use/Preserving Land, Air, and Water WG, which calls for a comprehensive watershed management plan.</p>
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Pass a County Council resolution to ask the State Department of Land and Natural Resources to reassess their unencumbered lands east of Wright Road and convert them to Natural Area Reserve or at least Forest Reserve status. These lands are contiguous with Ola'a Forest Reserve, and share its same forest resource values. 	<p>Suggested wording: <i>Request the Department of Land and Natural Resources to reassess their unencumbered lands east of Wright Road, contiguous to the Ola'a Forest Reserve and convert them to Natural Area Reserve or Forest Reserve status.</i></p>

Comments/Suggestions re Natural Resource Protection Working Group Recommendations

NATURAL RESOURCE PROTECTION WORKING GROUP:	COMMENTS/SUGGESTIONS:
<p>Instigate a temporary halt on all up-zoning and subdividing until Puna CDP is adopted by ordinance</p>	<p>These are initiatives that precede the CDP.</p>
<p>Establish an immediate moratorium on up-zoning and subdividing of parcels with significant native forest species on private lands. An example of plant species includes: Akia, <i>Clermontia</i>, <i>ilex</i>, Iama, Ohe, ‘Ohi‘a, Olapa, Pilo, Mauka, Kolea, Kopiko, Nanu or Na’u, and many others whose range has been reduced significantly by less appropriate types of agriculture, development lacking infrastructure, and subsequently invasive species, scrap metal and other large liter items and reduced chance for recovery</p>	
<p>Adopt a native forest protection ordinance for private and public lands in Puna and create a County Forester position</p>	<p>For ordinance, see last row in this table. For Forester, suggested wording: <i>Create an office of County Forester within the Planning Department.</i></p>
<p>Revise and expand Hawaii County Chapter 10, Erosion & Sedimentation Control Ordinance, to include contingencies for native species preservation:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Stop pin to pin grubbing and grading ▪ Stop grading trespass over adjacent boundary lines ▪ Stop grading and building on the wrong property ▪ Establish guidelines for forested buffer zones and setbacks. Requiring a minimum buffer zone coinciding with building set-back areas will protect the property rights of neighboring landowners by controlling the spread of invasive species and creating a visual and anti-noise buffer as well as preventing trespass and damage from dozers clearing over property lines 	<p>The following suggested wording addresses concerns about grading that were expressed by several WGs: <i>Amend the Hawai'i County Code to prohibit destructive grading practices on lands with native forest cover, as indicated in Figure __ [], by:</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • <i>Establishing minimum setbacks from property lines where no mechanical grading is permitted in order to provide forested buffer zones between properties and avoid trespassing by bulldozers into adjoining properties;</i> • <i>Defining and providing protective standards for unique geological features such as spatter cones, pit craters, lava tubes and collapsed lava tubes. [Note: This will probably be harder than it seems on its face, given the variety and number of geologic formations in Puna.]</i> • <i>Providing protective and restoration standards for cultural remnants uncovered by grading;</i> • <i>Require adequate bonding for mechanical grading and stiffer penalties for grading violations, including civil fines, suspension of construction permits and license to operate construction equipment.</i>
<p>Develop a strong education and outreach presence that includes:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ New programs <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Plant Inventory Mapping ○ Native species restoration and salvage ○ Invasive species awareness ○ Develop a website based on “Malama Puna a Mau Loa, Preserve and watch over Puna forever.” ○ Establish and implement a County environmental sustainability and stewardship education program. Prevent over-harvesting and theft of resources, encourage renewable practices and better regulation ▪ Partnerships between government and citizens <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Reach out to community groups and organizations. Offer presentations to community associations such as Lion’s Club, Rotary Club, property owners/subdivision associations, builders and contractor’s associations and unions ○ Provide field learning opportunities through volunteer programs and other 	<p>This are useful recommendations, but for the purposes of the CDP, the following, shorter wording is suggested: <i>Initiate, through the office of County Forester, an environmental sustainability and native forest stewardship education program, with support from partners such as Department of Land and Natural Resources, National Park Service, U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service, Department of Education, the University of Hawaii and non-profit and private sector organizations. Program activities might include:</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • <i>Conduct plant inventory mapping;</i> • <i>Undertake native species restoration and salvage;</i> • <i>Raise awareness of invasive species;</i> • <i>Develop a website based on “Malama Puna a Mau Loa (Preserve and watch over Puna forever)”;</i> • <i>Make educational presentations to community organizations, building industry and real estate associations, and schools;</i>

Comments/Suggestions re Natural Resource Protection Working Group Recommendations

<p>partnerships, to encourage and support the new service industry call for certified natural resources and contractors and consultants</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Develop and support a Puna Natural Resources Council, for facilitating public input with relation to natural resources, as well as a Puna Community Council to network special interest councils and to interact in decision making and planning ○ Partner with existing network, state, and Federal and non-governmental organizations and environmental groups such as the Big Island Invasive Species Committee, Malama o Puna, Outdoor Circle, Sierra Club, The Nature Conservancy, and the orchid and tea societies for funding, resources and knowledge to support the implementation of educational programs, fostering grassroots conservation ethic to enhance the management of Hawaii’s natural resources ○ Create a partnership with the Hawaii Island Board of Realtors to include in DROA disclosure information regarding any new County native forest preservation guidelines or regulations affecting lots intended for building. In addition, DROA documents to include tax incentives available for preservation of native forest, such and Chapter 19, Article 8, Section 19-59 of the Hawaii County Code – native Forest Dedication Program. Supply realtors, architects and building and landscape contractors with pamphlets and brochures which will educate them and their clients in sound land preparation and building practices <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Community gathering places <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Provide infrastructure to develop environmental learning resource centers for activities, programs, classes, internet website, printed materials, digital media and reference libraries, etc.; promoting sustainability and good land stewardship ○ Public infrastructure in the way of community gathering centers, buildings, offices and meeting halls are far and few between across Puna. Those that exist are or will soon be inadequate, not having enough space or seating for large crowds, some without electricity or kitchens ○ A successful outreach program is needed right away, and a place to stage field trips and outings from, conduct classes or research in, store data and documents safely in, meet at, etc., is key in getting a good outreach program off the ground. Mountain View, for example, could attract a great number of people who would otherwise not go to such events. The County should find a way to provide the communities gathering and meeting spaces. With certified kitchens and lots of rooms, it could also serve many other needs of the community and the County. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● <i>Advocate for renewable practices, prevention of over-harvesting and theft of resource, and more effective regulation</i> ● <i>Develop field learning opportunities for volunteers and apprentices to develop skills for certification as a natural resources contractor or consultant;</i> ● <i>Develop, in partnership with the Hawaii Island Board of Realtors, an information package for DROAs for real estate transactions that discloses guidelines and requirements for native forest preservation on lots intended for building, and information about tax incentives that are available for preservation.</i> ● <i>Develop and distribute information brochures for realtors, architects and building and landscape contractors that will educate them and their clients about appropriate land preparation and building practices in the context of Puna;</i> ● <i>Develop informational posters and other materials to display and distribute in community gathering places, such as commercial centers, schools, meeting halls and parks.</i>
<p>Direct Hawaii County to inventory and map significant native forest species on private lands, including existing subdivisions. An example of native forest species includes: akia, <i>Clermontia</i>, <i>ilex</i>, Iama, ohe, ohia, olapa, pilo, mauka, kolea, kopiko, nanu or na’u, and many others</p>	<p>This is very unlikely to happen in view of the County’s limited financial resources and expertise in this area. In addition, there are significant obstacles to this effort, such as gaining access to private lands. The partnership approach described above may have greater success in enlisting the cooperation of private landowners. As an alternative, the County could use maps that are compiled by others, such as Federal and State agencies, including the University of Hawai’i, which have far greater resources and expertise and, arguably, a legal mandate to undertake this type of project.</p>
<p>Establish a Biosphere Reserve Buffer Zone and boundary, officially recognized by Hawaii County, to protect and preserve the natural resources of Hawaii Volcanoes National Park, which has a United Nations International Biosphere Reserve designation. The Volcano Community</p>	<p>See response to Land Use/ Biosphere Reserve Buffer Zone WG.</p>

Comments/Suggestions re Natural Resource Protection Working Group Recommendations

<p>Association supports the expansion of the Biosphere Reserve to ultimately include Kahaualaeʻa and Puʻu Makaʻāla State Natural Area Reserves</p>	
<p>Support and expand existing County, State and Federal incentive programs for the preservation and management of native eco-systems on public and private lands</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Native Forests Dedication Program – Revise criteria for the County native forest dedication program to include one-quarter acre and larger parcels, if they are unbuilt upon and with intact and contiguous acres of native species. It is to allow vacant small lots to be saved as buffer lots. Many folks in small-lot subdivisions have more than one lot, used as buffers, but now pay high taxes on them. Also, when inherited, they are likely to be sold and built on. Therefore, if the owners dedicate the lots to the conservation (by relinquishing building rights), then they should get permanent tax breaks ▪ Conservation Easements – Establish a Puna or County-wide conservation easement policy into Hawaii County Code. This policy would allow owners to donate undeveloped lots to non-profit conservancies or governmental organizations. Lots would have significant conservation value, e.g.: forest, wetlands, endangered species habitat, beaches and scenic areas in accordance with IRS regulations on what can be protected by conservation easements. These lots would be assessed at a lower tax rate. Encourage the County to work with land trusts and government to find and design innovative funding and tax incentives for purchasing rights of selected properties. These would be used to help affect measures to reduce density and to protect the forest buffers ▪ Land Trusts – A Puna land trust of some kind could be the repository and managing body for Puna open space inventories. Tax exemptions could be given as an incentive to dedicate land to the land trust, for example. Lands condemned because of natural hazards could be banked here. Trading lands or affording the opportunity of for property owners who are destined to have their lands condemned for their safety or for the greater good, may be able to find satisfactory land in the land bank at the land trust return. 	<p>Suggested wording (omitting the explanatory text): <i>Support and expand existing County incentive programs for the preservation and management of native eco-systems on private lands by:</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • <i>Expanding the eligibility criteria for the County native forest dedication program to include parcels as small as one-quarter acre, if they are not developed and contain contiguous and intact coverage of native species;</i> • <i>Establishing a County conservation easement program allowing owners to donate development rights on undeveloped areas with significant natural or cultural resource value -- such as forest, wetlands, endangered species habitat, notable geological features, beaches and shoreline benches, archaeological remains and burials and identified scenic views -- to non-profit conservancies or governmental organizations in exchange for a property tax reduction.</i> • <i>Retaining lots that are in foreclosure for delinquent real property tax payments rather than having them auctioned for sale to the highest bidder, if those lots have significant natural resource value, as described above, and are not otherwise used as part of a land pooling program;</i> • <i>Partnering with non-profit land trusts to hold and manage the resources on conservation easements and other land acquisitions for natural resources preservation or enhancement purposes.</i>
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Empower local communities in Puna to define their boundaries and create guidelines to address future growth and the preservation of local natural resources. This could include the creation of Village Design Districts or Special Design Districts. 	<p>These recommendations are addressed in responses to other WGs.</p>
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Facilitate and implement, through County jurisdiction, Transfer of Development Rights to target commercial growth out of native forest and transfer it into areas designated for commercial development within village centers 	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Create a citizens’ advisory council for community based input to Hawaii County government. A “Puna Natural Resources Council” could fulfill much of its won recommendations, or at least play a major role in its implementation. Residents want more voice in the County decision making process for Puna. A network of Councils is suggested by various groups as a means to keep the community involved to implement the plans. Natural resources group supports the concept too. A Puna Community Council is much needed, potential facilitating the growing network of special interest councils 	<p>The proposal for a Puna Communities Council appears in several of the WG reports, sometimes by a different name or with a different function and organizational structure. Rather than respond to each WG’s proposal, there is suggested wording in the introduction to this table that attempts to describe the purpose and structure of a “Puna Communities Council” based on the combined proposals of the different WGs.</p>
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Lobby DLNR through the County of Hawaii to reclassify land use designations of parcels with significant native vegetation. This would ensure permanent protection of these forest areas as watershed, wildlife habitat and climate protection 	<p>This is not a very effective policy for the CDP, unless the areas are mapped or “significant native vegetation” is defined. Would this include small, isolated land areas that are not contiguous to the Conservation District?</p>
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Require residency for a specified duration (one or more years minimum) for an approved building permit. Implement stiff fines for non-compliance. Control growth and protect, preserve and manage natural resources by limiting the number of spec-building until 	<p>This would probably not withstand Constitutional challenge. A couple of decades ago a statute requiring a one-year residency in Hawaii before being eligible for employment with the State government was struck down in</p>

Comments/Suggestions re Natural Resource Protection Working Group Recommendations

<p>prohibiting them become possible.</p>	<p>Federal court.</p>
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Create a new County Natural Resources Department and an Invasive Species Coordinator position 	<p>This is unlikely to be implemented, given the financial resources of the County and the present responsibilities of the Federal and State governments for these concerns. However, a County Forester office – recommended above -- would be a relatively modest investment that could complement, rather than duplicate or attempt to compensate for the under-funding of, Federal and State agencies.</p>
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Adopt a Native Forest Protection ordinance for private and public lands within the jurisdiction of Hawaii County to mitigate the impact of future development on native forest through enforceable regulations and improved public awareness. 	<p>See responses to Land Use/ Biosphere Reserve Buffer Zone WG and to the proposals for public information/incentive programs.</p>

Comments/Suggestions re Parks & Recreation Working Group Recommendations

PARKS & RECREATION WORKING GROUP:	COMMENTS/SUGGESTIONS:
<p>Establish a permanent volunteer organizing committee with staff oversight whose mandate shall be assistance to the Parks and Recreation Department in coordination and facilitation of volunteer efforts in outreach, acquisition, funding, maintenance, programming and monitoring.</p> <p>Coordination and facilitation of volunteer efforts and outreach should:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Provide on-going support in planning and acquisition and outreach ▪ Assume organizational responsibility for a stewardship program ▪ Collaborate with the State Department of Land and Natural Resources (DLNR) Na Ala Hele program and community groups to inventory, plan and implement trail and bikeway systems ▪ Collaborate with traditional Hawaiian community to protect sensitive sites and coordinate stewardship activities ▪ Establish strong volunteer stewardship program to include, for example, site monitoring, pathway building and maintenance, interpretative activities, and outreach 	<p>Suggested wording:</p> <p><i>Establish a volunteer organizing committee to assist the Parks and Recreation Department in coordinating and facilitating volunteer efforts in support of the parks program, such as:</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ <i>Providing on-going support in planning and acquisition and community outreach;</i> ▪ <i>Assuming organizational responsibility for a stewardship program, to include, for example, site monitoring, pathway building and maintenance, interpretative activities, and outreach;</i> ▪ <i>Collaborating with the State Department of Land and Natural Resources' (DLNR) Na Ala Hele program and with community groups to inventory, plan and implement trail and bikeway systems;</i> ▪ <i>Collaborating with traditional Hawaiian practitioners to protect sensitive sites and coordinate stewardship activities.</i>
<p>Adopt policies of openness to all and the authority of the County for approval and oversight of private efforts undertaken on its behalf. Provide guidelines for securing approval and oversight</p>	<p>It's useful to have a functional classification, but Community Parks are missing from the list. "Turnout" would probably best be included with the designation of scenic corridors (e.g., "Red Road") rather than parks, so this is addressed in the response to Land Use/Preserving Land, Air, and Water WG recommendation to designate Highway 137 as a scenic corridor. It would also be helpful to</p> <p>The suggested wording below, in addition to classifying parks, organizes the recommended improvements and strategies for individual parks according to this classification:</p> <p><i>Provide functional classifications for Puna's parks:</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • <i>Camp Ground – An area with potable water and restroom facilities for overnight tent camping, which may be available on a permit or fee-for-service basis.</i> • <i>Coastal Activity Area – A shoreline recreational area that is accessed by a park or a public easement</i> • <i>Community Park – A recreational park or facility intended to be used primarily by residents of the area that is owned and maintained by the County or by a private entity with unrestricted public access</i>
<p>Provide functional definitions and strategies for types of parks</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Linear Parks – Non-motorized pathways (except motorized wheelchairs). To some degree, interconnecting throughout Puna these pathways may be adjacent to existing or new roadways on right-of-ways, or accompanying roadways or through greenbelts often with side extensions to provide view areas and/or siting. Usually linear parks are made possible through conservation easements or subdivision/industrial park agreements. The exception would be the one existing old railroad right of way which could be acquired through condemnation to connect HPP with Keaau and Hilo ▪ Preserves – Sites of significant natural or historical nature with appropriate signage and steward program monitoring. The Parks and Recreation Department would assess the viability of site visitor usage and implementation self-guiding or steward-led interpretative tours through the preserves where possible. Other site visitor usage would be clearly defined by the Department ▪ Camping Sites – Areas with available water and restroom facilities. Often fee-based with a subcontractor providing services ▪ Turnouts – Roadway pullouts at view and areas with parking and interpretative signage, and emergency phones and composting toilets where no such facilities are available within a reasonable distance ▪ Coastal Activity Area – Water access areas for various recreational purposes. 	

Comments/Suggestions re Parks & Recreation Working Group Recommendations

<p>Enhancement to the Isaac Hale Memorial Park</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ At the time of this report, conflicts with swimmer/boat access have yet to be resolved. The working group urges accommodation with the Smith and/or Ms. Kahueonalani Kupihea (perhaps through conservation easements) to provide shore access separate from the boat ramp. ▪ The tidepools beyond “Shacks” could be hand-developed as keiki pools separate from surfing and boating while retaining the traditional fish-netting traditions. ▪ Given the high use experienced now and expected in the future, the working group urges continual assessment of the adequacy of facilities. 	<p><i>County or by a private entity with unrestricted public access.</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • <i>Linear Park – A recreational, non-motorized pathway (except motorized wheelchairs), which may be inter-connected or within a right-of-way of an existing or new roadway, and is separated from travel lanes and adjacent properties by a landscaped buffer, with occasional rest stops or viewing spots.</i> • <i>Preserve –A site with features of significant natural or historic value that provides minimal facilities for public visitation, such as interpretive signage, a walking trail and small parking area, and is maintained by a stewardship program.</i>
<p>MacKenzie Park and the State and County property south of MacKenzie</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Create a joint management team State/County to plan for historical and environmental preservation/protection and to provide improvements to facilities, general park monitoring and camping permit regulations ▪ Consider expanding the camping area but within specific areas ▪ Convert the existing rough entrance to the south end into a maintained gravel or asphalt entrance road with a turnaround/drop-off point and handicapped/emergency parking only below the regular parking adjacent to the red road above. A well-graded walking path would connect upper and lower areas. Restroom facilities would be added to this south area ▪ Develop stewardship component for monitoring and on-going interpretative programs ▪ Plan and hold an opening with interpretative activities led by local experts 	<p><i>Following are strategies and proposals to expand or improve the inventory of parks, by park classification.</i></p> <p><u><i>Camp Grounds</i></u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • <i>Consider expanding the camping area within specific areas of MacKenzie State Park, to include State and County property south of MacKenzie.</i>
<p>Green Lake</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Land acquisition with the provision that it be developed as a nature park with native plant/habitat restoration, interpretative activities and other stewardship ▪ Develop a nature center with activities for school-aged students and the general public ▪ Utilize existing school programs and summer conservation program for restoration and stewardship activities 	<p><u><i>Coastal Activity Areas</i></u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • <i>Provide enhancements at Ahalanui Beach Park to include accessibility improvements, a screened changing area next to the showers designed to blend with the natural surroundings, repairs to the parking lot surface and added picnic tables.</i> • <i>Consider the development of “keiki pools” by making hand-developed modifications to the tidepools beyond “Shacks”, while retaining traditional fish-netting use.</i> • <i>Pursue the development of an ocean recreation park with potential boat launch ramp and marina facilities on State –owned accreted land at Cape Kumukahi, provided that Hawaiian burial sites are adequately protected and respected.</i> • <i>Consider the acquisition and development of Honolulu Landing and Sand Hill for coastal recreation use.</i>
<p>Hawaiian Paradise Park (HPP) 20 acre park</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ The County consider the HPP park project a precedent for County/community cooperation in a larger substandard subdivision ▪ Develop a facilities based park on a donated parcel within HPP to include all forms of recreation including swimming pool and tennis courts ▪ Pursue additional HPP community donation of land within the subdivision for field activities in different areas of the subdivision ▪ Aggressively pursue development of a passive cultural resources and ethno-botanical park on the HPP 31 acre parcel to include the rock wall native/introduced plants and exceptional trees which currently does not enjoy protection from development ▪ Consideration must e given to non-motorized travel to and from the park and several properties are near the old railroad right-of-way 	<p><u><i>Community Parks</i></u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ <i>Expand existing County recreational facilities in Pahoa into a Regional Park by making various improvements, to include: (1) Conversion of the existing fire station into a senior center with a certified kitchen for a congregate meals program and room for activities and dining, (2) Repair of the pump and provision of a solar heating system and heat-retaining cover for the swimming pool, (2) An</i>

Comments/Suggestions re Parks & Recreation Working Group Recommendations

<p>Linear Parks:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Complete development of Old Volcano trail as a pedestrian and cycle pathway <u>as soon as possible</u> ▪ Acquire rights of way and develop the old Railroad Ave. (railroad right-of-way) with access (hike, bike, horse) fro Kapoho to HPP ▪ Consider acquisition and development of the old right-of-way for the railroad from Railroad Avenue in Hilo to HPP through condemnation if necessary. 	<p><i>art center and covered performance stage, (3) a children’s museum and playground, (4) a skateboard park, (5) sheltered picnic areas, (6) a loop access road to lessen traffic on the main road through Pahoa, and (6) lighted parking areas and walking paths that are well-integrated to the Pahoa Village Center.</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • <i>Provide County assistance for the development of active recreation and community facilities, including a gym, field complex and community center on at least one of the 20-acre parcels owned by the Hawaiian Paradise Park Owners’ Association.</i>
<p>Pahoa Village Center Park</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Create a park within a multi-venue village center. Multiple venues, e.g., Senior Center, Gymnasium, Art Center, Performance Stage (covered), Children’s Museum would join the Pool, Community Center, and Skateboard Park. An economical “backpacker hotel” might be considered ▪ Create a loop access road to lessen traffic on the main road through Pahoa ▪ Share combined parking areas with landscape breaks and sheltered picnic tables and establish easy, well-lit walking paths to main street businesses ▪ Transfer the current Pahoa fire station to a senior services facility when the new fire station is built. Provide adequate staffing, a van and certified kitchen ▪ Provide a park, accessible from the various venues with an easy interior loop suitable for elderly/tot use, an exterior walking loop, tot lot 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • <i>Improve Shipman Regional Park by providing interior fencing and a parking layout that eliminates danger of cars backing into children chasing balls; more shade, seating, and picnic tables for spectators and supporters for games and other outdoor events; a large pavilion for team and family activities; additional fields for football and baseball; and additional lighting and more restrooms as increased usage requires.</i> • <i>Develop a new gym at Shipman Regional Park or acquire the National Guard Armory for this purpose.</i> • <i>Develop recreational programs to complement the use of Cooper Center and Volcano Community Park in partnership with the Volcano Community Association.</i>
<p>Red Road Scenic/Recreation Corridor:</p> <p>County Master Plans have separated individual recommendations. The working group urges the County to consider it as one corridor requiring partnership with the State, landowners, and tour van operators. Additionally, the County is urged to work with transportation to provide safe pull-outs, and waling and bike lanes where available in the right-of-way. Specific suggestions include: adding a restroom and emergency phone along route below Seaview before Kehena Beach, creating access, a simple walking trail on the lava and new parking area with restrooms on the State owned accretion land at the new Kamu Beach <i>[tour companies should be involved in the process and share in the cost]</i>, posting appropriate warning signage where appropriate, in newly realigned sections: covering old section of road with cinder soil to allow naupaka to reclaim road, and providing interpretative signage</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • <i>Provide accessibility, playground and other improvements at Mountain View Community Park and A. J. Watt Gym.</i> • <i>Expand hours of operation and night lighting for some outdoor activities at regional and larger community parks to serve working adults and young retirees.</i> • <i>Develop a new senior center in Mountain View with a certified kitchen for a congregate meals program, room for activities and dining, restrooms, and van vehicle and staff.</i> • <i>To supplement Community Parks, recreation facilities and meeting rooms at public schools should be made available for community use after school hours, whether through direct requests from a community representative to a school principal or a formal standing agreement between the County and the Department of Education.</i>
<p>Cape Kumukahi:</p> <p>Support and actively pursue the development of a major water recreation park with ocean access and potential boat launch and full scale marina on state accretion land. The State and County need to provide access and water related activities in Puna as well as the rest of the County. Any activity must be at a distance from Hawaiian burial sites</p>	<p><u>Linear Parks</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • <i>When acquiring rights-of-way for constructing new roadways or improving existing major roadways, make provisions for parallel multi-use recreational trails with appropriate landscaped buffers on either side and provide connections to other such existing or planned trails, to the extent possible.</i>
<p>Nanawale Forest Reserve, Sand Hill, and Honolulu Landing:</p> <p>All have the potential for future development as the Puna population continues to increase. This is a priority for acquisition and development if funding can be found perhaps using the 2% money</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ <i>Complete development of Old Volcano Trail as a pedestrian and cycle pathway.</i>
<p>Pahoa Pool: Resolve pump/power outage problems. Provide solar system for heating and consistently use an easy on/off covering for heat retention in Pahoa pool. Expand the hours in the morning, evening, and weekends for working adults. Leave message on answering machine when pool is closed</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ <i>Acquire the former railroad right-of-way from Kapoho through Hawaiian Paradise Park and develop it for hiking, bicycling and</i>
<p>Ahalanui Park: Construct handicapped entrance to the hot pond at the pond entrance closest to the walkway, provide screened changing area near shower – make out of more natural material to</p>	<p><i>haha, back riding</i></p>

Comments/Suggestions re Parks & Recreation Working Group Recommendations

<p>blend with surroundings, fix and maintain parking lot surface and provide more picnic tables</p> <p>Shipman Park: Improve interior fencing and parking to eliminate danger of cars backing into children chasing balls, provide more ohana/fan support (shade, coverings, benches, picnic tables), construct a large pavilion for team/family activities, and additional fields for football and baseball, provide additional lighting and more restrooms as use requires</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • <i>Plan for the acquisition and development of the former railroad right-of-way from Hawaiian Paradise Park to Railroad Avenue in Hilo, provided that measures are taken to protect agricultural uses of adjoining lands.</i>
<p>Waiopae Tidepools: Partner with the private subdivision to help provide restrooms and trash relief. Provide parking that doesn't use private land. There needs to be water quality monitoring. Work with other County agencies on a requirement that new construction/owners must convert to a septic system with a pump-out system – possible with tax credit</p>	<p><u>Preserves</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • <i>For designated preserves, assess the appropriate level of site visitor usage and implement self-guided or steward-led interpretative tours through the site.</i>
<p>Mountain View Gym: Upgrade buildings</p>	
<p>Shipman Beach: Shorten access and maintain trail</p>	
<p>Kahakai Beach Park: Continuing support for improvements</p>	
<p>Develop recreational activities to complement Cooper Center activities and plans</p>	
<p>Enhance recreational activities that integrate the Volcano community</p>	
<p>Monitor and address the recreational needs of all subdivisions (using the HPP park as a potential developmental model)</p>	
<p>Establish and restore the mauka and makai access to Keaau Beach (Haena, Paki, and Papai)</p>	
<p>Expand the pavilion across from Hirano store</p>	
<p>Senior Services – provide more hours and encourage involvement of young retirees while providing adequate care for the indigent elderly</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Conversion of the existing Pahoia fire station into a senior center with a certified kitchen; provision of a van, 2 staff ○ Create a new senior center in Mountain View with a certified kitchen; restrooms; provision of a van; and 2 staff 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • <i>Improve conditions at Wai'ōpae Tidepools by: (1) offering tax credits to nearby private landowners as an incentive to convert existing cesspools, where they exist, septic tanks with a pump-out system; (2) providing a public sanitary facilities, including a toilet and trash receptacle, (3) providing off-street parking that does not encroach into private lands.</i> ▪ <i>Consider acquiring Green Lake and adjacent land for native plant/habitat restoration and a nature center with activities and interpretive programs for school-aged students and the general public.</i> • <i>Consider hiking trails through Nanawale Forest Reserve, provided that areas with intact native forest are adequately protected.</i> • <i>Pursue development of a passive cultural resources and ethno-botanical park on the 31-acre parcel in Hawaiian Paradise Park, to include the rock wall, native and introduced plants and exceptional trees.</i>
<p>Work with Public Works (right-of-ways), Land Use, local subdivisions, communities, and individuals to create linear parks</p>	<p>Duplication of previous recommendations.</p>
<p>Provide a diversity of recreational areas and programming for passive to active activities for individuals of all ages and abilities</p>	
<p>Provide lighting and expanded hours for working adults</p>	
<p>Provide covered shelters</p>	
<p>Provide heating for the Pahoia Pool</p>	
<p>Develop a multi-faceted stewardship program (construction/maintenance, monitoring, and interpretation) with comprehensive training including local knowledge and tradition</p>	<p>These recommendations are incorporated, for the most part, into the above suggested wording for parks improvements and expansions. Some specific proposals, such as “an economical ‘backpacker hotel’”, were not included because they did not seem to relate to parks.</p>
<p>Schedule interpretive programs, demonstrations and knowledge-sharing activities</p>	
<p>Use signage and monitoring by the stewardship program in undeveloped and land bank areas and in nature preserves</p>	
<p>Support stewardship monitoring with local police activities</p>	
<p>Involve the neighboring community in specific community-support activities and continually assess their needs and concerns</p>	
<p>Use the stewardship program to develop outreach to the schools</p>	
<p>Involve school programs and summer youth conservation programs</p>	
<p>Provide opportunities and grant-funded work for students to enhance appreciation of recreational</p>	

Comments/Suggestions re Parks & Recreation Working Group Recommendations

sites	
Seek funding for student-created oral-history projects with public presentations	
Develop a memorial commemorative program to add community value to site assets	

Comments/Suggestions re Public Services & Infrastructure Working Group Recommendations

<p>PUBLIC SERVICES & INFRASTRUCTURE WORKING GROUP:</p>	
<p>Expand existing medical facilities or construct new medical facilities in upper and lower Puna</p>	<p>Suggested wording:</p>
<p>Use the Waianae Coast Comprehensive Health Care Center as an example to expand services and create new medical programs</p>	<p><i>Pursue the development of a full-service health and emergency care facility in Puna, at one or more locations with convenient access to a highway, that is developed on the model of the Wai‘anae Coast Comprehensive Health Care Center (O‘ahu) by:</i></p>
<p>Land for new medical facilities may be available from four different sources</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Privately owned lands (too expensive) ▪ Shipman Company (focus primarily on development in Keaau) ▪ County of Hawaii lands ▪ Hawaiian Homelands 	<p><i>• Forming a non-profit organization and securing a capacity-building grant from the Hawai‘i Community Foundation, the Weinberg Foundation or other private or public funding source for initial planning and organization;</i></p> <p><i>• Seeking State assistance in the form of grants-in-aid and/or the dedication of public land for the development of the facility.</i></p>
<p>NO OTHER PUBLIC SERVICES OR INFRASTRUCTURE WERE ADDRESSED IN THIS WG REPORT.</p>	<p>The following suggested wording is based on the future plans for other public service and infrastructure improvements that have been disclosed by County agencies in interviews and at public meetings:</p> <p><i>Develop new County police and fire stations near Pahoa and Keaau, with access to a major highway to optimize response time for emergency calls. The Keaau fire station will serve as Battalion Headquarters for Puna and include rescue and HazMat companies.</i></p> <p><i>Replace the KMC fire station with a new County fire station at a location that provides better coverage for the entire Volcano community.</i></p> <p><i>In more populous subdivisions, such as Hawaiian Paradise Park, Hawaiian Beaches and Shores and Ainaloa, the County will supplement its County fire stations by providing equipment, training, and some paid staff positions for volunteer stations. At Hawaiian Paradise Park, the County will fund the construction of a permanent fire station. Additional volunteer stations may be developed as other subdivisions grow in population.</i></p> <p><i>Encourage the Department of Education to locate future elementary schools in designated Community or Neighborhood Village Centers so that schools will be within a walking or bicycling distance for more students and close to transit stops.</i></p> <p>Water system development is a very important issue that has not been addressed by any WG. Based on comments during the Small Group process, the break-out group discussions at the two CDP workshops, and statements and plans submitted by community associations, it appears that there is support for water system development to replace catchment systems in the more rapidly developing subdivisions in Puna Waena (e.g., Hawaiian Paradise Park, Ainaloa, Orchidland), and to expand access to the</p>

Comments/Suggestions re Public Services & Infrastructure Working Group Recommendations

existing Mountain View-Ola'a system to support agricultural uses. There appears to be little or no support for public water systems in the "Central Corridor" subdivisions extending from Volcano through Hawaiian Acres. The suggested wording below reflects this understanding:

Make public water supply system enhancements in the following locations to support specific objectives:

- *Investigate and develop additional groundwater sources in the Ola'a area to increase capacity to support agricultural uses and the development of designated Village Centers at Mountain View and lower elevations;*
- *Provide County financial assistance to extend public water system service to lots that rely on catchment systems in subdivisions that lie mostly below 800 Feet MSL in elevation, provided that the owners' association has approved a plan to develop a Village Center within the subdivision. [See, also, suggested wording for County assistance for the formation of Village Centers.]*

Comments/Suggestions re Transportation/New Alternative Corridors Working Group Recommendations

SOCIAL SERVICES WORKING GROUP:	COMMENTS/SUGGESTIONS:	
Increase prevention education around substance abuse.	<p>These statements provide background information or express goals that are incorporated in subsequent recommendations for implementation, so they are addressed below.</p>	
Support existing strategic plans developed by substance abuse agencies serving the Puna district, such as the Healing Our Island 2004 Hawaii Island Meth Initiative		
Create additional residential treatment homes, especially for women and children		
Support programs that emphasize family involvement		
<p>Create a One Stop Center to provide linkages, support and advocacy related to substance abuse treatment and prevention as well as the other issues listed Below in Section Three: Additional Issues That Need to Be Addressed.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Although the concept of a One Stop Center may sound elaborate or expensive, it need not be. It could be as simple as harnessing an existing office space and coordinating its use amongst multiple providers that offer the services listed 		
Form partnerships with public and private organizations such as but not limited to the Big Island Substance Abuse Council (BISAC), Hui Ho’ola, Salvation Army Family Intervention Services, Lokahi Treatment Centers, and Ohana Ho’opakele to increase prevention education and treatment for substance abuse		
<p>Support the County of Hawaii Consolidated Plan 2005-2009 – The three big sections covered are housing and special needs housing, homeless, and community development</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Specifically support the Community Alliance Partners (CAP) Logic Model Big Island Strategic Plan on Homelessness 		
Increase affordable housing for people with low income, people with disabilities and the elderly including rental and ownership opportunities		
Create a One Stop Center to provide linkages, support and advocacy related to housing as well as the other issues listed below in Section Three: Additional Issues That Need to Be Addressed.		
Encourage the maintenance and rehabilitation of the existing housing inventory to maintain the viability of existing communities		
Support the development of alternative housing ownership strategies which provide options for low-cost and more accessible home ownership. This includes offering educational programs targeting financial skills to increase opportunities for home ownership, as well as education on effective rental strategies for owners and tenants		<p>Suggested wording: <i>Support measures to maintain sound housing stock, increase low-cost home ownership and opportunities for affordable rental housing. For example:</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • <i>Promote lower-cost self-help housing construction by seeking State enabling legislations to allow homeowners and organizations such as Habitat for Humanity to do their own plumbing and electrical work.</i> • <i>Offer educational programs, through the County housing agency, to develop financial skills of renters who seek opportunities for home ownership, and to develop awareness of effective rental strategies for owners and tenants.</i> • <i>Sponsor, through the County Office of Housing and Community Development, programs to increase homeownership opportunities, such as the HOME Investment Partnerships Program for mutual self-help housing development and limited-equity cooperatives.</i> • <i>Promote multi-family housing—especially for those with special needs, such as the elderly – in designated Regional or Community Village Centers.</i>
Form partnerships with public and private organizations such as Habitat for Humanity, Hawaii County Economic Opportunity Council (HCEOC), and Hawaiian Homelands to develop affordable housing and rental units		
Encourage planning for multi-family residential areas near future commercial centers in the existing subdivisions to provide transportation and housing options for residents who cannot or do not wish to be auto-dependent		
Encourage more lease held housing development options for non-profit organizations		
Examine the feasibility of utilizing community land trusts to acquire and hold land for the benefit of a community and provide secure affordable access to land and housing for community residents		

Comments/Suggestions re Transportation/New Alternative Corridors Working Group Recommendations

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • <i>Provide low-interest loans, on a sliding scale according to household income, for the repair and renovation of existing housing.</i>
<p>Create a One Stop Center to provide linkages, support and advocacy related to the following issues:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ substance abuse treatment and prevention; ▪ housing and special needs housing, homeless, and community development; ▪ teen pregnancy prevention/birth control; - need to increase effective education efforts ▪ child care options – these need to increase ▪ transportation and service coordination; ▪ employment; ▪ serving clients with disabilities; ▪ domestic violence screening/abatement/prevention; ▪ access to medical services for all residents; ▪ access to clean water and education on catchment water; ▪ coordination with a One Stop Center in Puna so homebound clients can also access that One Stop Center through initiatives such as the Block Nurse Programs (BNPs), Navigator Programs, or Home Visiting Programs like the Neighborhood Place of Puna access that One Stop Center through initiatives such as the Block Nurse Programs (BNPs), Navigator Programs, or Home Visiting Programs like the Neighborhood Place of Puna 	<p>Suggested wording: <i>In either or both of the Regional Village Centers (Kea‘au and Pahoa), create a One-Stop Center to provide referrals, support and advocacy related to the following issues:</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • <i>Substance abuse treatment and prevention;</i> • <i>Assistance for housing, special needs housing, homeless persons, and community development;</i> • <i>Teen pregnancy prevention/birth control;</i> • <i>Child care and elder care options;</i> • <i>Transportation and service coordination;</i> • <i>Employment;</i> • <i>Serving clients with disabilities;</i> • <i>Domestic violence screening/abatement/prevention;</i> • <i>Access to medical services, including nursing programs for homebound clients;</i> • <i>Access to clean water and education on catchment water.</i> <p><i>The issues involve several agencies, so not all direct services need to be available on-site, but the space, facilities and staffing for the Center would be provided by County and/or State funding. Non-profit as well as public agencies that provide social services and counseling would be encouraged to participate by supplying the resource information.</i></p>
<p>Encourage the development of accessible social activities, especially for youth and seniors, including securing appropriate facilities as well as increasing the accessibility to community centers. This can include facilities that may be recently vacated or unfinished. For example, the soon to be vacated Pahoa Fire Station could be used as the Senior Center</p>	<p>These recommendations are addressed in the response to the Parks & Recreation WG.</p>
<p>School facilities should be made available to the community for recreation and other compatible uses during after school hours</p>	